

Evaluation of Post-Certification Teacher Competency Improvement Policies at Madrasah Aliyah Negeri Medan City

Juliani¹, Saiful Akhyar Lubis², Wahyudin Nur Nasution³

¹Universitas Islam Negeri Sumatera Utara Medan, Indonesia

*Correspondence: julianinst24@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

The aim of this research is to describe the evaluation of post-certification teacher competency improvement policies at Madrasah Aliyah Negeri Medan City. This research method is a qualitative research method with a phenomenological research approach. Collecting data using the method of observation, interviews, study documentation. The results of this study, namely (1) the policy context, such as competency training, educational qualifications, MGMP empowerment workshops and implementation of supervision. (2) Input, namely trying to become an institution that can help teachers sent by madrasahs so that they have more ability in the 2013 Curriculum-based learning process. assignments in accordance with the demands of graduate competence, content, learning process, and 2013 curriculum assessment. (4) The product of the policy explains that the result is that the teacher has the ability to prepare syllabus, lesson plans, worksheets, teaching materials/materials, the media used in delivering material and the ability to compile an instrument for assessing student learning outcomes based on the 2013 Curriculum.

Keywords: *Evaluation, Teacher Competence, Certification.*

ABSTRAK

Penelitian bertujuan untuk mendeskripsikan tentang evaluasi kebijakan peningkatan kompetensi guru pasca sertifikasi di Madrasah Aliyah Negeri Kota Medan. Metode penelitian ini adalah metode penelitian kualitatif dengan pendekatan penelitian fenomenologi. Pengumpulan data menggunakan metode observasi, wawancara, studi dokumentasi. Hasil penelitian ini, yaitu (1) konteks kebijakan, seperti pelatihan kompetensi, kualifikasi pendidikan, *workshop* pemberdayaan MGMP dan pelaksanaan supervisi. (2) Input/masukan yaitu berupaya menjadi lembaga yang dapat membantu guru-guru yang diutus oleh madrasah agar lebih memiliki kemampuan pada proses pembelajaran berbasis Kurikulum 2013. (3) Proses pelaksanaan kebijakan, yaitu pelaksanaan pelatihan yang diikuti oleh guru bertujuan agar guru mampu melaksanakan tugas sesuai dengan tuntutan kompetensi lulusan, isi, proses pembelajaran, dan penilaian kurikulum 2013. (4) Produk terhadap kebijakan menjelaskan bahwa hasilnya guru memiliki kemampuan menyusun silabus, RPP, LKS, bahan ajar/materi, media yang digunakan dalam penyampaian materi dan kemampuan dalam menyusun instrumen penilaian hasil belajar siswa berbasis Kurikulum 2013.

Kata Kunci: *Evaluasi, Kompetensi Guru, Sertifikasi.*

A. INTRODUCTION

Competence is a basic standard that must be owned by someone as a teacher. Teacher competence is integrated in the form of performance, including pedagogical, personality, social and professional competencies. Based on Government Regulation Number 19 of 2017, individuals who work as teachers must at least graduate D-IV/S-1 with an educator certificate. In line with this, Danim (2011) emphasized that these basic criteria are inherent in every educator in his professional duties. This is intended to create educational effectiveness and efficiency through aspects of education policy, so as to achieve national education.

An educator's certificate is a fundamental guide for a teacher to be considered a professional. This system is deliberately implemented to identify the level of eligibility of teachers (teachers) in each educational institution unit. The purpose of giving certification by the government to teachers is to determine the eligibility of teachers in carrying out their duties as learning agents in realizing national education goals, improving the process and quality of educational outcomes, increasing the dignity and professionalism of teachers (Adi, 2014).

Ideally, teacher certification is a process that can raise the dignity and prestige of teachers. With certification, teachers should further improve their discipline and performance in teaching. Certification has an impact on the teacher's paradigm of discipline and performance. Because with certification teachers are encouraged to make various preparations related to certification instruments (Alfiansyah, *et.al.*, 2020). One of the certification instruments is the teacher's performance itself as evidenced by various awards and certificates of participation and training. However, in reality, based on the results of observations made by the author on teacher competence at the Medan City State Madrasah Aliyah, it shows that teacher certification is not enough as an effort to realize and improve teacher competence. Even though a teacher has passed the certification and has received a professional allowance, it does not mean that the teacher has the competence required by the law above. To create teachers who are truly professional, post-certification requires systematic and synergistic and continuous efforts to ensure teachers remain professional.

Some of the problems that the author has obtained from the results of observations on the competence of certified teachers can be explained that teachers who have obtained work certification only want to carry out their obligations, and carry out the demands of their teaching hours, without prioritizing the quality of the learning carried out. Even the teacher's ability and mastery of various kinds of strategies or methods in learning did not experience significant changes in creating an active and fun learning atmosphere.

It turns out that the teacher certification policy has not only had a positive impact in the form of improving teacher welfare. The main objective of certification which is based on improving the competence and quality of teachers has not been achieved. The fact that the writer can point out based on the observations that have been made is that teachers who have passed certification are still not able to improve their performance optimally and satisfactorily. The competencies of post-certification teachers have not undergone significant changes as should be mandated in Law Number 14 of 2005 concerning teachers and lecturers, particularly in Permendikbud Number 18 of 2007. So it can be concluded that the certification program has not had an effect on increasing teacher competence and working motivation tall.

Every teacher who has passed the certification is considered appropriate and deserves to be given a professional allowance in the hope that they can maintain their quality and improve their competence as well as improve their own welfare. It turned out that the allowances given related to certification had no impact on performance. With this certification, teachers are not thinking about how to increase their professionalism and competence, but only about how to increase their number of certifications. Of course we can't forbid them from using it, but at least the teacher also doesn't forget the purpose of giving the certification. With certification, it is hoped that this country's teachers will improve their quality and can become inspirations in the world of education.

In fact, research on post-certification teacher competency has been extensively reviewed by previous researchers. The relevant ones include discussing the social reality aspect of post-certification teacher performance (Anggranei, 2020; Kartowagiran, 2011), profile and eligibility level of teaching post-certification professional teachers in educational institution units (Rahmaini, 2019; Umar, 2017), school internal evaluation and measuring post-certification teacher professionalism (Suparwoto, 2011; Ansori, *et.al.*, 2017), the quality and impact of teacher certification on the learning process in the classroom (Amiani, 2022), post-certification teacher competency test (Muslimin, 2020), as well as mapping the competence and performance of post-certified madrasah teachers (Cahyotlogo & Jumadi, 2017; Khodijah, 2013).

It is hoped that the allowance received will not only be used for teacher welfare, but also in return they can improve themselves to be better (increase competence). What happens is that the professional allowance that teachers get from certification is used solely for welfare improvement. The finding that there is no correlation between increasing competency

and professionalism with certification makes the state have to demand and evaluate the certification policy.

Even though according to the author's opinion, teachers who have obtained professional educator certificates should have competence and high work motivation for the world of education they are involved in. This fact needs to be scrutinized so that the goal of increasing teacher competence and professionalism after certification is truly achieved. Based on the background of these problems and some of the results of initial observations in the field, the authors feel interested in conducting research related to the Evaluation of Post-Certification Teacher Competency Improvement Policies at Madrasah Aliyah Negeri Medan City.

B. METHOD

This type of research is a qualitative approach, namely research that uses a natural setting, with the intention of interpreting the phenomena that occur and is carried out by involving various existing methods. In qualitative research according to the view of Moleong (2015) "usually the methods used are interviews, observation and use of documents". The implementation of this study aims to describe the evaluation of post-certification teacher competency improvement policies at MAN Medan City.

In accordance with the implementation of research methods with a qualitative approach, several terms are used to refer to research subjects. The research subject is also known as an informant because the informant provides information about a particular group or entity, and the informant is not expected to be a representative of that group or entity. Another term is participant (Assingkily, 2021). According to Saebani (2009) that participants are used, especially if the subject represents a certain group, and the relationship between the researcher and the research subject is considered meaningful to the subject. The terms informant and participant are substantially seen as the main instruments in qualitative research. Furthermore, as an informant in this study, it was adjusted to the focus of the research, namely regarding the evaluation of post-certification teacher competency improvement policies at MAN Medan City.

Data collection techniques are carried out in several ways according to the need to obtain data from the research field. To obtain data holistically and integratively, as well as pay attention to the relevance of the data to the goals to be achieved, in collecting data this study used three techniques offered by Bogdan & Biklen (2014), namely interviews, participant observation, and study documentation. The stages of data collection in this study

were by conducting interviews with informants who had been determined in the research who were considered capable of providing data and information according to research needs, observing research locations and conducting documentation studies of the implementation of learning, especially the competence of certified teachers. The instrument used in this study is a human instrument, because the data collected is through the main instrument, namely the researcher himself.

In collecting data according to Sugiyono (2019) it is needed in research carried out using techniques that are adapted to the situations and conditions of the research field, data collection involves mainly through observation or observation, interviews and document review. Data analysis in qualitative research takes place in cycles and is carried out throughout the research process. Data and information are in the form of field notes, results of interviews with participants and analysis of documents related to the evaluation of post-certification teacher competency improvement policies at MAN in Medan.

The first data obtained is still general in nature, then a more structured observation is carried out to obtain more specific data. For this reason, the data obtained is then analyzed through the process. Miles & Huberman (2016) suggests that data analysis techniques are data reduction, data presentation, drawing conclusions. Furthermore, to strengthen the validity of the data findings and the authenticity of the research, the researcher refers to the use of standard data validity checks. According to Moleong (2015) to strengthen the validity of the data findings and maintain the validity of the research data, several criteria that can be used as a standard reference for validity include: credibility, transferability, dependability and confirmability.

C. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Results

With the context of the post-certification teacher competency improvement policy in each Medan City State Madrasah Aliyah based on awareness to support post-certification teacher competency improvement, madrasahs specifically develop programs and support policies for post-certification teacher competence, one of which is carried out by the Education and Training Center Religion of Medan, North Sumatra. Several activities as an effort to increase teacher competence by providing opportunities to participate in training programs, training, MGMP activities, workshops and so on.

Several activities, training and programs that are determined to be carried out as an increase in teacher competence are determined through a School Work Plan which is

prepared both in the short term, the medium term and the long term. This program is to support integration with the work program set and implemented by the Ministry of Religion of Medan City at the Medan Religious Education and Training Center as well as at schools.

Teacher competence in the learning process is the main factor in supporting the success of learning and being able to produce quality students. Teacher competence has certain specifications that can be seen and measured based on specifications or competency criteria that must be possessed by every teacher. Improving the quality of education cannot be separated from efforts to increase the competence of educators and educational staff such as conducting training, debriefing, and empowering teachers, of course very important to improve their quality. In this regard, Uno (2018) emphasized that teacher competence is related to the quality of teachers in carrying out their duties such as: working with students individually, preparation and planning of lessons, utilization of learning media, involving students in various learning experiences, and active leadership from the teacher.

To improve teacher competence is strongly influenced by the desire and motivation of the teacher. The teacher is a very decisive component in the success of an education. This is indeed reasonable, because the teacher is the spearhead who is directly related to students as subjects and learning objects. This is based on the competence of the teacher is the ability of a teacher both practical and theoretical abilities. However good and ideal the educational curriculum is, how complete the educational facilities and infrastructure are and how strong the enthusiasm of the students is, without being matched by the ability of the teacher, then everything will be less meaningful.

The implementation of education and training for certified teachers at MAN Medan City is carried out in order to improve teacher competency in the 2013 Curriculum-based learning process at the Medan Religious Education and Training Center. The policy of the Ministry of Religion of the City of Medan in collaboration with madrasas is an effort so that teachers have competence based on the 2013 Curriculum. The implementation of education and training has guidelines and implementation techniques that have been set so that they go according to plan and achieve the targets that have been set. In order for the implementation of these activities to run successfully, the implementation of education and training at the Education and Training Center must be supported from various things.

In the implementation of education and training programs at the Medan City Education and Training Center, one factor that cannot be ignored is the role of the tutor (*widyaiswara*) as the HR implementing activities at the Education and Training Center. Tutor (*widyaiswara*) whose main task is to educate, teach, and train the State Civil Apparatus

(ASN) through training programs. Training participants have the right to get the best instructors, so widyaiswara are competently required to be the best in their fields. According to Bernardin & Russel (2016) that training refers to changes in the form of specific knowledge, skills and behavior, and to be more effective it is necessary to involve learning experiences in planning an activity in the organization. An important component contained in the implementation of education and training, has the task of facilitating the transfer of knowledge, namely widyaiswara.

Then widyaiswara in the opinion of Wahardi (2013), has a very important role as a resource person, trainer and teacher in the implementation of training as an instrument for developing apparatus human resources. Widyaiswara are Civil Servants (PNS) who are appointed as functional officials by authorized officials with duties, responsibilities, authorities and rights to carry out educational, teaching, training (Dikjartih) activities Civil Servants (PNS) Evaluation and development of education and training (training) at government education and training institutions (training).

Several activities, programs, education and training that are determined to be carried out as an increase in teacher competence are determined through a School Work Plan which is prepared both in the short term, the medium term and the long term. This program is to support integration with the work program set and implemented by the Ministry of Religion of Medan City at the Medan Religious Education and Training Center as well as at schools. Through educational and training activities at the Medan Education and Training Center, post-certification teachers strive to gain new knowledge, skills and attitudes that change their behavior. So that teachers are able to make a maximum contribution in carrying out their duties towards achieving educational goals in madrasas so as to produce quality output.

Improving post-certification teacher competence at MAN Medan City is centered on education and training programs implemented at the Medan City Education and Training Center. As a training institution that is handled and implemented by experts who are competent in their field, it is appropriate for teachers who take part in education and training activities at the Medan City Education and Training Center to have increased competence after attending the training. According to Pribadi (2014), the implementation of education and training programs by education and training centers or Pusdiklat plays an important role in preparing human resources so that they have the ability to work effectively and efficiently. In addition, the implementation of training programs is also useful to be used in overcoming performance problems faced by a company.

Related to the process of implementing the post-certification teacher competency improvement policy at the Medan City MAN which was carried out at the Medan City Education and Training Center, it played a role in improving the ability of teachers to manage and carry out learning, especially the ability of teachers to carry out Curriculum 2013 learning and focus on teacher pedagogic and professional competence. Post-certification teacher pedagogical and professional competency improvement is carried out in order to strengthen teachers' abilities to implement the 2013 Curriculum as an effort to realize the successful implementation of the 2013 Curriculum. Teachers in charge of Madrasah Aliyah Medan are teachers who specifically teach according to the competency of their subject. The teacher clearly has to master the guidelines for implementing the curriculum that are on target for implementation. However, in the policy of increasing personal and social competencies, teachers who have been certified at MAN Medan City are still minimal, so it is necessary to pay attention to it so that all teacher competencies develop in a balanced manner.

To improve the ability of teachers to carry out their duties and responsibilities in learning, the implementation of the post-certification teacher competency improvement program was carried out by the Medan Religious Education and Training Center, the Ministry of Religion of Medan City and the Medan City State Madrasah Aliyah. The importance of implementing post-certification teacher competency improvement, so as to optimize the implementation of learning, special coaching for certified teachers is carried out through training. This training is to further develop the potential and competence of teachers to optimize the implementation of learning so that it has a positive impact on the progress of education.

One of the essential realities about raising educational standards is that professional teachers must be trained and created to be successful. These teachers will then have greater authority and responsibility for future educational planning. The issue of how to improve teacher quality is one that the Indonesian education system must pay attention to in order to prepare skilled teachers for the future. Therefore, teachers must be given content as strengthening the ability to implement the 2013 Curriculum as an effort to realize the successful implementation of the 2013 Curriculum. Teachers in charge of Madrasah Aliyah Medan are teachers who specifically teach according to the competence of their subjects. The teacher clearly has to master the guidelines for implementing the curriculum that are on target for implementation. For this reason, teachers need to have competencies that are truly capable of optimizing the implementation of learning, especially the 2013 Curriculum.

In addition, training programs for teachers are needed, such as training in improving learning models, teaching aids, lesson planning, making materials, and other issues. Through this training, educators can quickly adapt new skills and teaching methods, which increases their ability and motivation to do their job more professionally. Teachers need special training to broaden their perspectives and advance their skills. These trainings will be more useful for teachers who are committed to lifelong learning. Teachers who participate in various training programs both inside and outside the classroom can improve their competence.

So the implementation of the training that must be followed by teachers in increasing competency is skills on the 2013 Curriculum concept, Analysis of 2013 Curriculum Teaching Materials, Learning Design Modules, and Guided Learning Practices. This training supports the success of teachers in learning. Teachers who have been certified are the main executors, so teachers must also have competence and take part in self-skills education and training activities. Although the curriculum is not the only factor that influences the quality of education, the curriculum is a guide for teachers to carry out and direct learning activities to achieve learning goals because the curriculum is closely related to educational success. In an education system, the curriculum is dynamic and changes and developments must always be made in order to keep up with the developments and challenges of the times. Changes and curriculum development must be carried out systematically and directed. Curriculum change and development must also have a clear vision and direction.

The implementation of the competency improvement program implemented at the Medan City Education and Training Center plays a role in improving the ability of teachers to manage and carry out learning, especially the ability of teachers to carry out Curriculum 2013 learning. Education and training is one way of developing human resources to improve the ability of employees to handle various types of tasks and apply the abilities needed according to the type of work available, so that the teacher can do his job optimally. It is stated that the purpose of education and training is to increase the knowledge, abilities and skills of teachers so that they are more professional in carrying out their work so that organizational goals can be achieved and have a link with teacher performance.

In order to get the best results, the process of education planning, training, and teacher management should be followed to improve the quality and capabilities of human resources. Requirements and needs analyzes should be reviewed or carried out before providing additional information to teachers. The purpose of this analysis of requirements and needs is to determine and find out how their (teachers) are currently capable and what should be

mastered, as well as what information is needed for them to carry out their duties and obligations related to their work. Even so, the addition of knowledge is not enough to be able to lead a teacher to work professionally.

Discussion

According to Friedman and Yarbrough in Sagala (2012) defines "Training is a process used by organizations to meet their goals. It is called into operation when a discrepancy is perceived between the current situation and a preferred state of affairs". This definition also provides an understanding that a training is considered successful if it is able to bring the reality of current human resources to a reality of human resources that should be desired by the organization so that the role of the trainer in the learning process is to help teach trainees to be able to change what is usually displayed at this time. behavior that should be expected by the institution.

Furthermore, Musfah (2011) that training has a very significant influence on the effectiveness of a school. Training provides an opportunity for teachers to gain new knowledge, skills and attitudes that change their behavior, which will ultimately increase student achievement. Training must be in accordance with the needs of teaching teachers. Organizers must carefully plan each training, starting from the selection of materials, time, place, method to the quality of the instructors.

In the context of curriculum, Hamalik (2018) suggests that curriculum is an educational program provided by educational institutions for students. The curriculum is not limited to a number of subjects but all things that can affect student development. The curriculum is a plan that contains content and learning materials, ways, methods or learning strategies, and is a guideline for organizing teaching and learning activities. In the 2013 curriculum, curriculum development begins with setting graduate competency standards based on student readiness, national education goals, and needs. After the competencies are determined, the curriculum is determined, which consists of the basic framework of the curriculum and the structure of the curriculum. Education units and teachers are not given the authority to compose syllabuses, but are compiled at the national level. Teachers are given more opportunities to develop the learning process.

In developing the competency-based 2013 Curriculum according to Amri (2013) that there are three things that need attention, namely determining the competencies to be achieved, developing strategies to achieve competencies, and evaluation. The competency to be achieved is a goal statement to be obtained by students, describing learning outcomes in

the aspects of knowledge, skills, values, and attitudes. The strategy for achieving competence is an effort to help students master the set. Evaluation is an assessment activity of competency achievement for each learner.

As according to Sabon (2019) in his research "The Effectiveness of Teacher Training Through Teacher Professional Education And Training" that education and training as a series of activities that prioritize knowledge, skills and improving the attitude of an employee in carrying out their duties in order to achieve organizational goals effectively and efficiently . Therefore, the implementation of education and training programs is very important for employees both now and in the future, because with education and training the abilities, knowledge, skills, attitudes and productivity of employees will increase.

According to Suyatno (2012) that training is an activity carried out in the context of developing or increasing competence in carrying out duties as an educator, both at the sub-district, district/city, provincial, national and international levels. Physical evidence of this component can be in the form of a certificate, charter, or statement letter from the education and training administration institution. In line with this explanation according to Musfah (2011) that training has a very significant influence on the effectiveness of a school. Training provides an opportunity for teachers to gain new knowledge, skills and attitudes that change their behavior, which will ultimately increase student achievement. Training must be in accordance with the needs of teaching teachers. Organizers must carefully plan each training, starting from the selection of materials, time, place, method to the quality of the instructors.

D. CONCLUSION

Based on the description above, the conclusion of this study is that policy evaluation is carried out effectively for increasing the competence of post-certification teachers at the Medan City State Madrasah Aliyah. This can be observed in the classification of four aspects, namely context, input, process and product (CIPP). First, the policy context, such as competency training, educational qualifications, MGMP empowerment workshops and implementation of supervision. Second, Input, namely trying to become an institution that can help teachers sent by madrasas to have more skills in the 2013 Curriculum-based learning process. demands of graduate competence, content, learning process, and 2013 curriculum assessment. Fourth, the product of the policy explains that the result is that teachers have the ability to prepare syllabi, lesson plans, worksheets, teaching materials/materials, the media used in delivering material and the ability to prepare outcome assessment instruments 2013 Curriculum-based student learning.

REFERENCES

- Adi, I. R. (2014). *Psikologi, Pekerjaan Sosial dan Ilmu Kesejahteraan Sosial*. Jakarta: PT. Raja Grafindo Persada.
- Alfiansyah, M., Assingkily, M. S., & Prastowo, A. (2020). "Kebijakan Internal Madrasah dalam Meningkatkan Mutu Pendidikan di MI Nurul Ummah Kotagede Yogyakarta" *MAGISTRA: Media Pengembangan Ilmu Pendidikan Dasar dan Keislaman*, 11(1), 52-67. <https://publikasiilmiah.unwahas.ac.id/index.php/MAGISTRA/article/view/3460>.
- Amiani, M. (2022). "Intervensi Kualitas Proses Pembelajaran yang Diampu oleh Guru Pasca Sertifikasi dan Dampaknya" *PEDIR: Journal of Elementary Education*, 2(1), 100-111. <http://download.garuda.kemdikbud.go.id/article.php?article=2948350&val=26133&title=INTERVENSI%20KUALITAS%20PROSES%20PEMBELAJARAN%20YANG%20ODIAMPU%20OLEH%20GURU%20PASCA%20SERTIFIKASI%20DAN%20DAMP%20AKNYA>.
- Amri, L. E. P. (2013). *Panduan Memahami Kurikulum 2013*. Jakarta: Prestasi Pustakaraya.
- Anggranei, F. N. (2020). "Realitas Kompetensi Guru Pasca Sertifikasi" *Scientific Journal of Reflection: Economic, Accounting, Management and Business*, 3(4), 331-340. <http://www.ojspustek.org/index.php/SJR/article/view/229>.
- Ansori, M., Arief, S., & Sukirno, S. (2017). "Profesionalisme Guru Akuntansi Pasca Sertifikasi" *Jurnal Pendidikan Ekonomi dan Bisnis*, 5(1), 106-120. <http://journal.unj.ac.id/unj/index.php/jpeb/article/view/1937>.
- Assingkily, M. S. (2021). *Metode Penelitian Pendidikan: Panduan Menulis Artikel Ilmiah dan Tugas Akhir*. Yogyakarta: K-Media.
- Bernardin, O., & Russel, D. (2016). *Perilaku Organisasi, Terjemahan Jilid 3*. Yogyakarta: Andi Offset.
- Bogdan, S. K., & Biklen, R. C. B. (2014). *Qualitative Research for Education: An Introduction to Theory and Methods*. Boston: Allyn and Bacon, Inc.
- Cahyotlogo, B. D., & Jumadi, J. (2017). "Pemetaan Kompetensi Pedagogik, Profesional, Kepribadian dan Sosial Guru Fisika SMA di Kabupaten Kulon Progo Pascasertifikasi" *Jurnal Pendidikan Fisika dan Keilmuan*, 3(2), 96-109. <http://e-journal.unipma.ac.id/index.php/JPFK/article/view/1199>.
- Danim, S. (2011). *Pengembangan Profesi Guru; Dari Pra-Jabatan, Induksi, ke Profesional Madani*. Jakarta: Kencana Prenada Media Group.

- Hamalik, O. (2018). *Manajemen Pengembangan Kurikulum, Edisi Revisi*. Bandung: Remaja Rosdakarya.
- Kartowagiran, B. (2011). “Kinerja Guru Profesional (Guru Pasca Sertifikasi)” *Jurnal Cakrawala Pendidikan*, 3(3). <http://journal.uny.ac.id/index.php/cp/article/view/4208>.
- Khodijah, N. (2013). “Kinerja Guru Madrasah dan Guru Pendidikan Agama Islam Pasca Sertifikasi di Sumatera Selatan” *Jurnal Cakrawala Pendidikan*, 5(1). <http://journal.uny.ac.id/index.php/cp/article/view/1263>.
- Miles, M. B., & Huberman, M. (2016). *Qualitative Data Analysis: A. Methods Sourcebook, Edition 3*. USA: Sage Publications.
- Moleong, L. J. (2015). *Metodologi Penelitian Kualitatif (Edisi revisi)*. Bandung: Remaja Rosdakarya.
- Musfah, J. (2011). *Peningkatan Kompetensi Guru Melalui Pelatihan dan Sumber Belajar Teori dan Praktik*. Jakarta: Kencana.
- Muslimin, M. (2020). “Program Penilaian Kinerja Guru dan Uji Kompetensi Guru dalam Meningkatkan Prestasi Kerja Guru” *Indonesian Journal of Education Management & Administration Review*, 4(1), 193-200. <https://jurnal.unigal.ac.id/index.php/ijemar/article/view/4384>.
- Pribadi, B. A. (2014). *Desain Pengembangan Program Pelatihan Berbasis Kompetensi*. Jakarta: Kencana.
- Rahmaini, R. (2019). “Menakar Kompetensi Guru Pasca Sertifikasi” *Benchmarking-Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan Islam*, 3(1), 57-66. <http://jurnal.uinsu.ac.id/index.php/benchmarking/article/download/6959/3132>.
- Sabon, S. S. (2019). “Efektivitas Pelatihan Guru Melalui Pendidikan dan Latihan Profesi Guru” *Jurnal Penelitian Kebijakan Pendidikan*, 11(3), 159–182. <https://doi.org/10.24832/jpkp.v11i3.210>.
- Saebani, A. (2009). *Metodologi Penelitian Kualitatif*. Bandung: Pustaka Setia.
- Sagala, S. (2012). *Supervisi Pembelajaran dan Profesi Kependidikan*. Bandung: Alfabeta.
- Sugiyono, S. (2019). *Metode Penelitian Kuantitatif*. Jakarta: Rineka Cipta.
- Suparwoto, S. (2011). “Evaluasi Kinerja Guru IPA SD, SMP, dan SMA Pasca Sertifikasi” *Jurnal Kependidikan Penelitian Inovasi Pembelajaran*, 41(1). <http://journal.uny.ac.id/index.php/jk/article/view/506>.
- Suyatno, A. (2012). *Panduan Sertifikasi Guru, Edisi Revisi*. Jakarta: Indeks.
- Umar, S. (2017). “Profil Kompetensi Guru SD Pasca Sertifikasi” *Jurnal Pembelajaran Prospektif*, 1(1), 41-50. <https://jurnal.untan.ac.id/index.php/lp3m/article/view/18988>.

- Uno, H. B. (2018). *Profesi Kependidikan, Problema, Solusi dan Reformasi Pendidikan Indonesia*. Jakarta: Bumi Aksara.
- Wahardi, W. (2013). *Peran Widyaiswara dalam Meningkatkan Kualitas Proses Pembelajaran pada Lembaga Pendidikan dan Pelatihan Pemerintah*. Jakarta: Penerbit Indeks.