Edukasi Islami: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam, VOL: 12/NO: 04 November 2023 P-ISSN: 2252-8970 DOI: 10.30868/ei.v12i04.5312 E-ISSN: 2581-1754

Barriers To The Implementation of Learning Organization In Private Universities

Titi Hendrawati¹, Firdiansyah², Ayatullah Humaeni³

^{1,2} Sekolah Tinggi Agama Islam Haji Agus Salim Bekasi ³UIN Sultan Maulana Hasanuddin Banten *Correspondence: *titihendrawati1@gmail.com*

ABSTRACT

Implementing the concept of learning organization in private universities is a big problem. This article highlights potential barriers to transforming private colleges into responsive, innovative, and learning-oriented organizations. These barriers include a strict corporate culture, insufficient resources, lack of leadership support, vague goals, and difficulty managing change. However, the article also provides ways to overcome these challenges, such as developing a learning culture, wise resource allocation, dedicated leadership, explicit goal setting, and effective change management. By implementing these solutions, private universities can become dynamic and relevant educational institutions, ready to meet the changing demands of the education sector. This article demonstrates the important function of a learning organization in improving the quality of higher education and preparing students for a competitive future. The purpose of this study is to examine the barriers to the implementation of learning organization and describe the solutions to these barriers. Descriptive qualitative and case study methodology through data collection through interviews, observations, and document analysis to find out more about the implementation of a learning organization and its impact on the performance of private universities. The findings of this study are intended to show the importance of developing a learning organization in a higher education environment as well as dealing with barriers to implementation.

Keywords: Barriers and Solutions, Learning Organization, Private Universities

A. INTRODUCTION

A Learning Organization is an organization that actively develops and prioritizes continuous learning, innovation, and adaptability. Peter Senge first proposed this idea in his book "The Fifth Discipline" (Peter M. Senge, 1990). The core idea is that a learning organization is better equipped to deal with changes and problems because it allows organizational members to continuously learn and interact to improve performance.

Being a learning organization is particularly important in the context of private institutions. Colleges are learning institutions that should promote continuous learning among staff, teachers, and students. This will help the college to stay abreast of developments in education, technology and research, so that it can provide quality education and continuously improve services. In addition, private institutions that transform into learning organizations can more quickly react to changes in regulations, policies, and educational trends.

One of the most common misconceptions about learning enterprises is that learning organizations only apply to higher education institutions. The emphasis may be on educational institutions, but any enterprise that promotes growth through learning and develops that growth in the future can be considered a learning organization (Richardt, 2022). Despite the strong support and intuitive appeal of schools as learning organizations, relatively little progress has been made in research and practice. This lack of progress is partly due to a lack of clarity or a shared concept of schools as learning institutions. While reaching consensus is difficult, it can be achieved through further study and ongoing dialog among experts, policy makers and educators around the world (OECD, 2016).

Although the concept of Learning Organizations is well recognized in higher education, there are a number of constraints that make implementation a challenge for many private colleges. Most private colleges operate under tight budget constraints, emphasizing business aspects such as revenue generation and competition in the education market. This can reduce efforts to continue learning. Moreover, in the education industry, intense competition and shareholder interests may encourage a focus on marketing techniques and revenue rather than long-term investment in learning and innovation.

Cumbersome bureaucratic systems and reluctance to change can also be a barrier. In addition, uncertainty in education laws, inadequate resources and lack of strong leadership support for change often complicate efforts to become a learning enterprise. While not easy, overcoming these barriers is critical for private colleges that want to improve the quality of learning and innovate in a competitive educational environment. Institutions must constantly

adapt and innovate to remain successful in difficult times. To do this, they must take deliberate action to strengthen their people and their capacity to change. That is why returning to the idea of a learning organization is a useful starting point for implementing essential change management and adaptive processes to successfully address current issues (Education, 2022).

The research on barriers to the implementation of Learning Organizations in private higher education has key objectives and benefits. The main objective is to identify, evaluate and understand the difficulties faced by private higher education institutions in developing a sustainable learning culture. We anticipate that this research will provide deep insight into the challenges that are often overlooked and plague learning endeavors in private higher education settings. Benefits include providing advice to private higher education institutions on how to overcome such barriers, allowing them to become more effective learning organizations.

In addition, the findings from this study can help further knowledge and understanding regarding the value of continuing education in private higher education, as well as the extent to which it affects the overall quality of higher education. Ultimately, the aim of this study is to encourage positive change in private higher education and enable it to meet the needs of an increasingly complex and changing world of education.

Research conducted by (Freed, Jann E.; Klugman, 1996), the results of the analysis resulted in the identification of four main issues in the development of the concept and practice of quality procedures including: (1) campus forces that drive change, (2) creating an institutional framework to implement and support quality improvement (e.g., establishing a results-driven mission statement); (3) variables that influence or hinder campus quality improvement efforts (e.g., leadership and data-driven decision making; The interviews revealed twelve points, including the importance of systems thinking, quality culture leadership, and building relationships with stakeholders. According to the study, institutions that have implemented quality principles and practices for at least three years have a culture that embraces change, have established mechanisms to support such efforts, and use feedback to continuously improve their systems and processes.

B. LITERATURE REVIEW

The idea of a learning organization continues to evolve along with the theory. Since its inception until today, several definitions have been given based on the opinions and factual results of professionals in the organization. A learning organization, according to Yuesti (in

Sunarta, 2021) is an organization that always provides opportunities for its members to develop themselves in order to achieve individual and organizational success. Every employee will have the opportunity to do something that has never been done before to gain experience and new information in the company through learning.

Learning organization refers to a framework for improving an organization's capacity to continuously learn, adapt, and innovate. Peter Senge, a systems scientist and management specialist, created the learning organization. A learning organization is one that proactively develops, acquires and transfers knowledge, and changes the behavior of its members in response to new data and insights. In other words, a learning organization is an organization that continuously strengthens its capacity to develop and adapt (Wibowo, 2015).

A learning organization is an organization that allows its members to experiment, learn from previous experiences, and adapt responsively to change (Marsick, V. J., & Watkins, 2003), meaning it is free to try new things and make past experiences as learning to improve future performance. Meanwhile, Senge (in Osagie, Wesselink & Mulder, 2022) emphasizes the importance of core learning capabilities, namely, building a shared vision and testing mental models, and developing systems thinking to implement a learning organization. Jamali (in Osagie, Wesselink & Mulder, 2022) concluded that businesses should have specific learning characteristics (e.g., learning culture, team building, and shared goals).

Peter Senge encouraged learning organizations and attempts to remove the assumption that organizations consist of separate parts in his book The Fifth Discipline, which is the most popular book on the subject of systems thinking and learning organizations. A learning organization is defined as an organization in which the individuals who work there continuously acquire the capacity to produce the results that are truly expected (P.M. Senge, 1994). The concept that organizations are cultures or environments with certain characteristics, values, norms, and practices is known as the organization as culture perspective. This idea views the organization as a social system consisting of members and their culture, and not just as a formal and hierarchical structure. This concept was developed by several organizational experts after being introduced by management expert Edgar Schein. According to (Schein, 2010) the definition of an organization is a pattern of fundamental assumptions that are built and learned by a group after it is determined that these assumptions are capable of external adaptation and internal integration and produce results that demonstrate the validity of these assumptions so that they can be taught to new groups so that the right members can provide a view of thinking and relating to various problems.

The learning organization believes that individuals within it are proactive to improve their abilities, strive to progress, and continue to learn by fostering an open corporate atmosphere and transparent information flow. This condition will produce a continuous process while still referring to the internal conditions of the organization, which in turn refers to the external situation and demands outside the organization (Pangaribuan, 2012).

Private universities face a number of obstacles and barriers in implementing a learning organization, including: 1) limited resources; Private institutions sometimes have limited resources, such as budgets, teaching staff, and infrastructure, which can make learning organization ideas difficult to implement, for example, according to research (Anggraini, 2017), PT Pos Indonesia Regional X Makassar has difficulty in implementing the Learning Organization model due to inadequate resources, 2) unsupportive organizational culture; Implementing the idea of learning organization will be hampered by organizational culture that does not support learning and cooperation, for example, research (Pangaribuan, 2012) shows that PT Pos Indonesia Regional X Makassar has difficulty in implementing the concept of learning organization due to unsupportive organizational culture, 3) lack of awareness and skills; shows that private universities often lack awareness and skills about the concept of learning organization (Jubaedah, 2010).

4) lack of support from leaders; based on research (Cahyadi, 2021) shows that school leaders who do not support learning and collaboration can hinder the implementation of the concept of learning organization, 5) external environmental challenges; such as intense competition and regulatory changes, can hinder the application of the concept of learning organization in private higher education, for example in UNY Journal (Wiyono, 2017) schools that face intense competition usually find it difficult to apply the principles of learning organization.

Related to the above, how do the factors of limited resources, unsupportive organizational culture, lack of awareness and skills, resistance to change, and regulatory uncertainty affect the efforts of private higher education institutions to become a learning organization in the context of private higher education, how do these obstacles impact the quality of education and innovation in private higher education, and what steps can be taken to overcome them and encourage continuous learning in private higher education?

C. RESEARCH METHOD

The research focuses on identifying and explaining the barriers to the implementation of learning organization at the Faculty of Islamic Religion, Universitas Islam 45 Bekasi. The

method used in this research is descriptive analysis, according to Rahayu (in Fitria et al., 2023), namely the data collected will be analyzed descriptively to provide a comprehensive description of the phenomenon under study. The research approach used qualitative research Bogdans and Taylor (in Fitria et al., 2023) state qualitative techniques as a research method, this approach produces descriptive data about individuals and behaviors that are considered in the form of written or oral notes, and looks at individual backgrounds comprehensively. In this scenario, there is no distinction between individuals or organizations into variables or hypotheses; instead, everything must be considered holistically.

Data and facts are collected through observation; the participant observation research approach is characterized by social interaction between the researcher and respondents with the natural surroundings, Through observation, the researcher visits the research site to observe the actions and behaviors of the individuals present (Creswell, 2009). Several respondents and resource persons were interviewed by the researchers, including the Rector, Head of Study Program, Head of Administration, and Lecturers at the Faculty of Islamic Religion, Universitas Islam 45 Bekasi. Researchers used documents in the form of photographs and data regarding the documents of Universitas Islam 45 Bekasi, which were then used to validate and support the data obtained through observations and interviews.

D. DISCUSSION RESULTS

Based on the results of the research obtained, various data indicate that there are obstacles to the implementation of learning organization at FAI Islamic University 45 Bekasi (FAI UNISMA Accreditation Form, 2021), namely:

1) In the mechanism and strategy of governance in carrying out its responsibilities, the Faculty of Islamic Religion of Islamic University 45 cooperates with the Directorate of Academic Service Administration (DAPA), Directorate of General and Information Technology (DUTI), Directorate of Student Affairs and Alumni (DIKA), Directorate of Research Institutions for Community Service and Cooperation (DLPPMK), and departmental laboratories both at the faculty study program and at the university level. In its implementation, all policies have been contained in the Chancellor's Policy Document on Governance, governance, and Leadership, but one of the obstacles related to this is the lack of socialization, the absence of operational guidelines on Governance, governance, and Leadership, and the unoptimal evaluation system for management and performance of all components of governance.

- 2) In the field of cooperation, the implementation of policy documents has not been optimal. Implementation of cooperation at the national, local and international levels has been carried out but there are several obstacles, namely well-documented cooperation reports, international cooperation has not been optimal in quantity and quality, not all UPPS collaborations have MOAs, budget availability to support cooperation activities outside the University is still not optimally facilitated by the university.
- 3) In the field of Human Resources, qualified teaching staff have met the standards but there are still those who have not continued their S3 (Doctoral) studies, not all lecturers have at least a lector functional position and get certification. In terms of developing lecturer competence, there are actually many opportunities and activities provided for this, but the obstacle is that the distribution of lecturers in competency development is not optimal.
- 4) Education personnel are quite adequate and most of them already have S1 qualifications, but there are also obstacles, namely, the placement of tendik has not been in accordance with academic qualifications, there are still tendik who do not have S1 qualifications, and related to the development of tendik competencies, the policy has also provided flexibility for competency development, but the obstacle is that the development program has not been carried out regularly and has not been in accordance with the competencies and tupoksinya.

In this article, we will further explore these challenges and find solutions to learning organization barriers at the Faculty of Islamic Religion, Universitas Islam 45:

1) The Faculty of Islamic Religion of Universitas Islam 45 works closely with various directorates, including the Directorate of Academic Services Administration (DAPA), the Directorate of General and Information Technology (DUTI), the Directorate of Student Affairs and Alumni (DIKA), and the Directorate of Research Institute for Community Service and Cooperation (DLPPMK), as well as departmental laboratories in the faculty and university. Nonetheless, although all policies relating to governance and leadership have been outlined in the Rector's Policy Document, some relevant challenges have emerged. These include the lack of proper socialization, the absence of clear operational standards for governance and leadership, and the inefficiency of the evaluation system in monitoring and assessing the performance of all aspects of governance.

Solutions for this; a) socialize the governance policy of FAI Universitas Islam 45 Bekasi through various media, including brochures, pamphlets, posters, websites, seminars, and workshops, to all stakeholders, both the academic community and the general public. It is hoped that this socialization will discuss the objectives and benefits of the established

governance policies, b) make clear and comprehensive operational guidelines (Juklak/instruction manual) for the governance of FAI Universitas Islam 45 Bekasi and socialize them to all stakeholders. Operational guidelines must provide specific information regarding methods, procedures, procedures, and standards that must be followed when carrying out governance rules, c) implement a comprehensive and transparent performance management and evaluation system for FAI Universitas Islam 45 Bekasi that includes all recognized governance elements. All parties must participate in this evaluation, which must be carried out periodically, so that it can be a useful tool for future policy formulation and improvement; d) Optimizing the use of information technology in implementing governance policies, among others by creating an online platform for reporting, monitoring and evaluating performance and governance management. By utilizing information technology, it is expected to facilitate and accelerate the process of collecting data and information needed in implementing government policies.

- e) In order for the management and evaluation of the governance policy of FAI Universitas Islam 45 Bekasi to be carried out more effectively and efficiently, a certain team or work unit is formed in charge of doing this; f) Creating a system of rewards and sanctions for actors who implement good governance policies or fail to meet predetermined standards. This system of rewards and sanctions can motivate actors to improve the performance and quality of governance management at FAI Universitas Islam 45 Bekasi.
- 2) In the field of cooperation at FAI Universitas Islam 45 Bekasi, policy documents have not been implemented optimally. The implementation of cooperation at the national, local and international levels has been running, but there are several obstacles, including cooperation reports that have not been well documented, international cooperation that has not been optimal in quantity and quality, not all UPPS Cooperation has an MOA, and the availability of a budget to support cooperation activities outside the university is still not maximally facilitated by the university. To overcome this, it is necessary to; a) improve the documentation system for FAI cooperation at Universitas Islam 45 Bekasi by building a digital archive that is centralized and easily accessible to all interested parties. Cooperation agreement letters, cooperation reports, and cooperation evaluation results are examples of documents that must be properly documented; b) increase the number of international cooperation units and provide training and competency development to existing staff. International cooperation units can also strengthen relationships with international institutions through various means, including face-to-face meetings, online conferences and social media;

- c) improve the quality of the Memorandum of Understanding of FAI Universitas Islam 45 Bekasi by including clearer and more comprehensive clauses and setting firm time limits for its implementation. The MoU can also be used to conduct monitoring and evaluation in cooperation; d) allocate sufficient funds to support cooperation initiatives outside the FAI institution of Universitas Islam 45 Bekasi, especially those that have the potential to have a significant impact on the university and society. The budget can come from various sources, including CSR programs, scholarships, research grants, and development funds; e) developing cooperation with institutions or organizations that have the same vision and goals as the university. Thus, cooperation can run smoothly and provide significant benefits for all parties involved; f) facilitating training and coaching for FAI Universitas Islam 45 Bekasi staff involved in cooperation in order to develop their abilities and expertise in managing cooperation well. It is hoped that by implementing the things described above, the effectiveness of the implementation of cooperation will increase, so that it is more beneficial for the institution and society.
- 3) The qualification standards of the teaching staff of FAI Universitas Islam 45 Bekasi in the field of human resources have been met, but some have not received a doctoral education, and not all lecturers have concurrent functional lecturer positions of at least lecturer and certified. Actually, there are many opportunities and activities available for lecturer competency development, but the challenge is that the distribution of lecturers in competency development is not ideal. Solutions to overcome this include; a) Increase the involvement of FAI lecturers at Universitas Islam 45 Bekasi in existing competency improvement programs such as training, workshops, seminars, conferences, and other development initiatives. This can be achieved by organizing these activities on a regular basis and providing appropriate incentives or appreciation to participating lecturers; b) facilitate and open opportunities for FAI lecturers at Universitas Islam 45 Bekasi to participate in available competency development programs. This can be done by providing clear and extensive information about these programs, as well as providing adequate technological support to lecturers;
- c) expanding access and possibilities for competency development for FAI lecturers at Universitas Islam 45 Bekasi by increasing cooperation between faculties or study programs with related institutions or organizations. This collaboration is expected to improve existing development programs and expand the network of cooperation between universities and other institutions or organizations; d) provide incentives or awards to FAI lecturers at Universitas Islam 45 Bekasi for increasing their expertise, such as salary increases or

promotions, professional certification, or other awards. This can be a motivation for lecturers to expand their knowledge and improve the quality of their teaching; e) develop a long-term competency development program that will assist lecturers in improving their competence in a gradual and planned manner. This program can also be tailored to more specific competencies according to the demands of the university and society. By implementing the solutions described above, it is expected that the distribution of lecturers in competency development will increase, so that each lecturer can improve their competence optimally and evenly. This will have a good impact on the quality of teaching, research, and community service of the university.

- 4) The education staff of FAI Universitas Islam 45 Bekasi is quite adequate, most of them already have S1 qualifications, but there are several obstacles such as the placement of tendik which is not based on academic qualifications, and there are still tendik who do not have S1 qualifications. There are several options that are feasible to do to overcome the obstacles to the placement of education personnel who are not in accordance with academic qualifications and needs, as well as education personnel who do not yet have S1 qualifications; a) review the university's organizational structure and staffing requirements to identify positions or jobs that are in accordance with the qualifications and competencies possessed by each education personnel; b) conduct training or competency development for FAI staff at Universitas Islam 45 Bekasi who do not yet have a bachelor's degree in order to improve qualifications and skills for their position; c) rotate FAI staff at Universitas Islam 45 Bekasi who have met the requirements and needs for positions that are more in line with their qualifications through internal promotions or rotations;
- d) conducting open recruitment with clear and transparent requirements to attract education personnel of FAI Universitas Islam 45 Bekasi with qualifications that are in accordance with the needs of the university; e) providing competency development programs for education personnel who already have undergraduate qualifications, but still need to improve their abilities and work experience in accordance with the demands of their work; f) conducting regular and transparent performance evaluations of FAI employees at Universitas Islam 45 Bekasi, as well as providing awards and incentives for students who excel and meet qualification and competency standards.

E. CONCLUSION

A learning organization is an organization that can continue to adapt and improve its performance in a sustainable manner. Learning is considered an important process to achieve organizational goals in learning companies, and the ability to learn is considered a valuable resource. The development of learning organizations is driven by a number of factors. Visionary leaders play an important role in fostering a strong learning culture. Leaders who support learning efforts and understand the value of learning will inspire organizational members to engage and participate in the learning process.

Implementing the Learning Organization concept in private higher education is an important issue, but it is also a tremendous opportunity. This article has highlighted a number of potential hurdles, ranging from inflexible corporate culture to inadequate resources. However, it is important to realize that these are not insurmountable barriers. Private colleges can overcome these barriers with dedication, good leadership and the right policies.

An actively promoted learning culture, proper resource allocation, clear goal formulation, and effective change management are essential in transforming private colleges into efficient and responsive learning organizations. These steps are critical to achieving the ultimate goal of improving the quality of education and preparing students for a competitive future. Private colleges can become relevant and active agents of change in the everchanging world of education by doing so.

REFERENCE

- Anggraini, R. (2017). Penerapan Learning Organization Pada Pt. Pos Indonesia Regional X Makassar. Universitas Muhammadiyah Makassar.
- Badan Akreditasi Nasional Perguruan Tinggi. (2021). Panduan Penyusunan Dokumen Program Studi. BAN-PT.
- Bratianu, C. (2015). *Organizational Learning and the Learning Organization*. *January*, 286–312. https://doi.org/10.4018/978-1-4666-8318-1.ch012
- Cahyadi, L. (2021). Memahami learning organization. Forum Ilmiah, 18(3), 381–390.
- Education, F. (2022). *Three Ways to Transform Your College Into a Learning Organization*. https://www.fierceeducation.com/more-education-news/three-ways-transform-your-college-learning-organization
- Eghe Osagie, Renate Wesselink, V. B., & Mulder, dan M. (2022). Learning Organization for Corporate Social Responsibility Implementation: Unravelling the Intricate Relationship Between Organizational and Operational Learning Organization Characteristics. *Organization & Environment Journals.Sagepub.Com/Home/Oae*, Vol. 35((1)), 130–153. https://doi.org/DOI: 10.1177/1086026620933915
- Fitria, N., Munandar, D. S., & Arifudin, O. (2023). Manajemen Pengelolaan Media Pembelajaran Pendidikan Islam. *Jurnal Pendidikan Islam, VOL: 12*(NO: 03), 2244. https://doi.org/10.30868/ei.v12i03.4660
- Freed, Jann E.; Klugman, M. R. (1996). Higher Education Institutions as Learning Organizations: The Quality Principles and Practices in Higher Education. *ASHE Annual Meeting Paper*. https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/ED402845.pdf
- John W.Creswell. (2009). Research desain Pendekatan Kualitatif, Kuantitatif, dan Mixed, Terj. Achmad Fawaid. Pustaka Pelajar,.
- Jubaedah, E. (2010). ANALISIS KONSEPTUAL ORGANISASI PEMBELAJARAN (LEARNING ORGANIZATION) SEBAGAI TEORI ORGANISASI KONTEMPORER. Jurnal Ilmu Administrasi, 7(4).
- Marsick, V. J., & Watkins, K. E. (2003). Demonstrating the Value of an Organization's Learning Culture: The Dimensions of the Learning Organization Questionnaire. *Advances in Developing Human Resources*, (2),(5(2),), 132–151.
- Lembaga Penjamnan Mutu. (2021). Borang Akreditasi FAI UNISMA. Bekasi: FAI UNISMA
- OECD. (2016). What makes a school a learning organisation? A guide for policy makers, school leaders and teachers. https://www.oecd.org/education/school/school-learning-organisation.pdf
- Pangaribuan, A. (2012). Analisis Penerapan Organisasi pembelajar di PT Telekomunikasi Indonesia TBK Jakarta Berdasarkan Persepsi Karyawan Divisi Human Resource [Universitas Indonesia]. https://lib.ui.ac.id/file?file=digital%2F20354729-S-Anugrah+Pangaribuan.pdf
- Purwanto, N. (2008). Pengaruh Politik Dalam Bidang Pendidikan. *Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan UNY*, 02, 114488.
- Richardt, C. (2022). What is a learning organization? https://ecampusontario.pressbooks.pub/educationleadershipmanagement/chapter/1-2-

- what-is-a-learning-organization/
- Ritonga, D. I. (2014). Analisis Pelaksanaan Learning Organization (Lo) Di Fakultas Bahasa Dan Seni (Fbs) Universitas Negeri Medan. 124, 1–20.
- Schein, E. H. (2010). *Organizational Culture and Leadership*. (Fourth Edi). Jossey Bassa Publisher.
- Senge, P.M. (1994). The Fifth Discipline: The Art and Practice of the Learning Organization. Doubleday.
- Senge, Peter M. (1990). The fifth discipline: The art and practice of the learning organization. Doubleday.
- Sunarta. (2021). Membangun Organisasi Pembelajar. *Jurnal Ilmu Manajemen*, *Volume 18*,(Nomor 2,), Hal. 62-76.
- Wibowo, A. (2015). Manajemen Kinerja: Konsep, Aplikasi, dan Evaluasi. Rajawali Pers.
- Wisnumurti, A. A. G. O. (2017). Revitalisasi Tata Kelola Perguruan Tinggi. *Unit Penerbitan* (UP) Pusat Penelitian Dan Pengabdian Pada Masyarakat (P3M) Unipas Singaraja., (P.1-12). ISBN 978-979-17637-3-8)
- Wiyono, G. (2017). Strategi Penerapan Organizational Learning Untuk Membentuk Guru Pembelajar Di Sekolah. *Jurnal Edukasi Elektro*, *1*(1), 69–77. https://doi.org/10.21831/jee.v1i1.15113
- Zahari, I. Bin, & Shurbagi, A. M. A. (2012). The Effect of Organizational Culture and the Relationship between Transformational Leadership and Job Satisfaction in Petroleum Sector of Libya. *International Business Research*, 5(9). https://doi.org/10.5539/ibr.v5n9p89