

Religious Indoctrination in The 2013 Islamic Religious Education Curriculum: A Content Analysis Of Teaching Materials And Its Implications

Ifah Khadijah, Hoerul Umam

Universitas Islam Nisantara Bandung, Indonesia
(ifahkhadijah@uninus.ac.id)
(hoerul.umam@uninus.ac.id)

ABSTRACT

This study conducts a comprehensive analysis of the 2013 Islamic Religious Education curriculum, using the framework of religious indoctrination theory. It examines the curriculum's impact on learners, particularly its potential to restrict creativity or promote independent thinking. The study investigates the curriculum and related materials, employing qualitative content analysis to uncover embedded meanings. Findings reveal the curriculum's susceptibility to indoctrination, particularly when hindering students' critical thinking. The analysis highlights several key observations: (1) The 2013 curriculum prioritizes memorization over comprehensive understanding; (2) Textbooks and teacher's books encourage passive acceptance of Islamic teachings, lacking critical thinking promotion; and (3) Teacher's books lack specificity, allowing individual religious orientations to influence instruction, potentially perpetuating negative practices.

Keywords: 2013 Curriculum, Indoctrination, Intolerance, Islamic Religious Education, Religious Education

A. INTRODUCTION

According to the 2017 survey conducted by the PPIM, Islamic Religious Education is believed to contribute to the prevalence of intolerance among Indonesian Muslim adolescents. It is noteworthy that not only the content of the subject matter but also the influence exerted by teachers plays a significant role in shaping intolerant attitudes (PPIM, 2017). The findings of this survey have prompted an examination of the 2013 curriculum, which serves as the educational framework for Muslim students, as surveyed by the PPIM. The curriculum exerts an impact on individuals' distinctiveness, personal aspirations, choices, and the process of constructing personal meanings (Null, 2017), encompassing the interpretation of relationships within the context of intolerance. The curriculum is widely regarded as a transformative journey of learning that holds the potential to imbue students' lives with deeper significance and purpose, fostering personal growth (Schubert, 1986).

Extensive research has been conducted in the field of Religious Education, exploring its intersections with environmental issues (Parker, 2016), political policies, conceptual frameworks, and the broader educational system (Raihani, 2017; Raihani, 2011). These studies offer valuable critiques and suggestions to enhance the implementation of Islamic Religious Education (PAI) as a cornerstone for cultivating tolerant identities among the Indonesian Muslim youth. This paper specifically centers on the curriculum, recognizing it as the fundamental foundation from which all educational practices emanate, ultimately shaping the entire education system, as Raihani (2017) has emphasized. Nonetheless, it is crucial to acknowledge that the curriculum is an expansion of a broader comprehension. This understanding is rooted in the realization that the curriculum is intricately intertwined with the questions of "what," "why," and "how" students learn, experience, and develop (Null, 2017; Schubert, 1986). The question of "what students learn" generally encompasses knowledge, skills, habits, and experiences. The question of "why they learn those things" delves into their relevance or connection to individual interests, physical and mental development, socio-cultural (or political) context, and academic factors. Lastly, the question of "how they learn" should align with developmental, socio-cultural, and pedagogical considerations. Nevertheless, contemporary curriculum development practices often prioritize the mechanical aspects or the "how" of curriculum implementation, inadvertently neglecting the deeper ontological (what) and axiological (why) dimensions (Schubert, 1986).

The primary focus of this paper is Islamic Religious Education in Indonesia. This choice is motivated by the fact that Islam boasts the largest number of followers in the country, and a significant number of practitioners have a rich history of overseeing religious education. The objective is to scrutinize the 2013 curriculum for Islamic Religious Education, employing the theory of indoctrination in education. This selection is driven by the specific intention to examine the primary school level curriculum. Religious education is regarded as an indoctrination process, wherein students internalize religious doctrines to conform to pre-established religious frameworks. It is believed that this process of indoctrination and initiation influences the religious practices of future generations in Indonesia. For example, Islamic Religious Education, as suggested by PPIM (2017), is implicated in the development of intolerant attitudes.

Extensive scholarly research has been devoted to investigating the phenomenon of indoctrination within the realm of religious education. Notable researchers such as Tan (2011),

Copley (2005), and Coulson (2004) have critically examined this subject matter. These scholars share a common suspicion towards the presence of indoctrination in religious education, as evidenced in their works (Coulson, 2004; Tan, 2011; Copley, 2005; Kazepides, 1983). Coulson (2004) goes as far as asserting that Islamic schools in countries with Muslim majorities, such as Pakistan and Indonesia, engage in indoctrination practices that promote ideologies of intolerance, violence, and animosity. Similarly, Copley (2005) notes that the historical experiences of Europe have instilled a heightened sense of vigilance among Europeans towards religious indoctrination. Reflecting upon the same underlying concerns, Kazepides (1983) elaborates on the detrimental effects of teaching religious doctrines, emphasizing that its primary objective is not to foster intellectual enrichment and development, but rather to exert complete control over the expression of diverse opinions. He warns that individuals subjected to such indoctrination will inevitably live under a palpable and absolute tyranny, despite lacking the freedom to acknowledge their lack of liberty (Kazepides, 1982).

Tan (2004) posits that indoctrination exerts influence on the emergence of negative attitudes, such as intolerance and even radical behavior. This stems primarily from its ability to instill control beliefs in students, thereby fostering the development of ideological totalism. According to Tan (2011), this indoctrination is evident within Indonesian schools, encompassing three dimensions: the religious curriculum, school activities, and the hidden curriculum. While Tan acknowledges that indoctrination is not inherently negative, they provide evidence of negative indoctrination occurring in the Indonesian educational system through the religious education curriculum. In light of these insights, this paper adopts an indoctrination theory perspective to analyze the 2013 curriculum for Islamic Religious Education.

Prior to presenting the critical analysis of the 2013 curriculum, this paper conducts a comprehensive literature review exploring the concept of curriculum and education as vehicles for indoctrination and initiation. Subsequently, the employed methodology is outlined. Lastly, the paper concludes by deliberating on the implications and findings for religious education in Indonesia.

B. METHOD

This study endeavors to examine the positioning of learners, as the primary recipients of education, within the context of the 2013 curriculum, with specific emphasis on whether they are exposed to indoctrination that suppresses their creative imagination. The research focuses on scrutinizing the curriculum itself and the accompanying materials, including student textbooks and teacher's manuals. A qualitative content analysis approach is employed to thoroughly investigate these texts (van den Akker, 2006). Qualitative content analysis serves as a valuable method for revealing the embedded meanings in the texts, thereby facilitating descriptive analysis. Within the scope of this paper, the qualitative content analysis method is defined as a comprehensive set of techniques for systematically examining diverse text types, delving beyond the surface-level content to explore the underlying themes and core ideas that constitute the primary substance of the texts (Schreier, 2012).

C. RESULT AND DISCUSSION

The findings of the analysis on the content of the 2013 curriculum will be presented in two sections, namely: (1) Analysis of Core Competencies and Basic Competencies in Islamic Religious Education, and (2) Analysis of the textbooks and teacher's manuals in Islamic Religious Education.

1. A Study of Core and Basic Curriculum in Islamic Religious Education

The 2013 curriculum encompasses four core competencies: spiritual, social, cognitive, and skills. The spiritual competency aims to foster students' acceptance of their beliefs and religious convictions, as well as the associated values. The social competency is concerned with the acquisition and application of shared values and traditions that enable students to engage effectively in social and cultural contexts, including interactions within the family, among peers, towards educators, and with their community. The cognitive competency focuses on students' comprehension of factual and conceptual knowledge through the process of observation (listening, observing, reading) and questioning, driven by their innate curiosity about themselves, the wonders of creation, and the phenomena they encounter in their homes and schools. Lastly, the skills competency pertains to students' ability to effectively demonstrate and apply the factual and conceptual knowledge they have acquired in a coherent and logical manner, expressed through clear and articulate language, aesthetically pleasing creations, physical movements that reflect a healthy disposition, and actions that exemplify the conduct of a righteous and morally upright individual. These four core competencies are intended to be integrated into all subject areas and are believed to equip students with a comprehensive and interconnected understanding of knowledge that is rooted in real-life situations (Ministry of Education and Culture Regulation, No. 57/2014).

The first core competency is the spiritual competency, which encompasses the domains of faith (Aqidah) and worship (the performance of obligatory acts as a distinguishing characteristic of a believer) within the Islamic teachings. In terms of the faith aspect, students at the first-grade level of elementary school are encouraged to develop the ability to "accept" and "believe" in accordance with Islamic principles. Regarding the worship aspect, students are encouraged to familiarize themselves with and engage in various acts of worship, as detailed in Table 1.

Table 1. Basic Competencies of Islamic Religious Education

Theological Aspects	Ritual Aspects
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Accepting the existence of Allah, the Most Merciful and Compassionate (1.3) and the Sovereign (1.5), acknowledging the oneness of Allah based on observations of oneself and His created beings encountered at home and school (1.4). Accepting and recognizing the meaning of the two testimonies of faith (1.6). - Believing that good behavior reflects one's faith. Such behavior includes respect and obedience towards parents and teachers (1.8), speaking kindly, politely, and courteously (1.9), expressing gratitude, forgiveness, honesty, and self-confidence (1.10). - Believing in the truth of the story of Prophet Adam (1.13), the story of Prophet Idris (1.14), the story of Prophet Nuh (1.15), the story of Prophet Hud (1.16), and the story of Prophet Muhammad (1.17). 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Developing a habit of (a) reciting the Basmala before commencing the study of the Qur'an (1.1), (b) engaging in the recitation of the Qur'an with proper intonation and rhythm (1.2), and (c) supplicating before and after studying (1.7). - Establishing a routine of purifying oneself before engaging in worship (1.11). - Observing the acts of worship, specifically performing the prayer (salat) in an orderly manner (1.12).

The concept of social competence in the realm of religious education is commonly linked to students' ethical engagement in social interactions. Islamic Religious Education interprets this social competence as the embodiment of noble character traits that arise from a profound comprehension of faith. Within the framework of the 2013 Curriculum designed for first-grade students, Islamic Religious Education formulates the social dimension to enable students to "demonstrate behavior" and "exhibit attitudes." These desired behaviors, deemed as essential competencies, encompass self-assurance, reverence, and obedience towards parents and teachers, forgiveness, honesty, gratitude, and the practice of personal hygiene, proper attire, and tidiness in personal belongings and surroundings. Simultaneously, the expected attitudes as competencies for first-grade students encompass compassion, care, cooperation, unwavering adherence to principles, discipline, politeness, forgiveness, enthusiasm, diligence in acquiring knowledge, industriousness, and honesty. In essence, it is anticipated that all these attitudes will spring forth from a comprehensive understanding of the Quran, the Beautiful Names of Allah (*Asmaul Husna*), the profession of the two testimonies of faith, the observance of prayer (salat), and the exemplary stories of the prophets (Adam, Idris, Nuh, Hud, and Muhammad, peace be upon them).

Islamic Religious Education encompasses two cognitive competencies: "knowing" and "understanding." The competency of "knowing" is specifically focused on the recognition of Arabic letters (*huruf hijaiyyah*) and their corresponding diacritical marks (*harakat*). Conversely, the competency of "understanding" encompasses a multifaceted range of topics for students, including the comprehension of Allah's existence, the profound messages conveyed in the Qur'an, the meanings encapsulated within the Beautiful Names of Allah (*asmaulhusna*), prayers, the significance of the two testimonies of faith, and the cultivation of noble character traits. Moreover, this competency entails comprehending appropriate

behaviors, such as demonstrating respect and obedience towards parents, communicating with kindness, politeness, and courtesy, acquiring a comprehensive understanding of the rituals of ablution (*wudlu*) and prayer (*salat*), as well as delving into the profound stories of exemplary prophets (Adam, Idris, Nuh, Hud, and Muhammad, peace be upon them). The final core competency, psychomotor or behavior, is further delineated into 17 fundamental competencies by Islamic Religious Education. These core competencies serve as an all-encompassing framework, ideally fostering students' ability to skillfully reproduce, thoughtfully reflect upon, and creatively apply the knowledge they have acquired.

Table 2. Derivation of Core Competencies in Islamic Religious Education

Psychomotor Competency	Islamic Religious Education
Reproduction	<p>Recite: <i>Surah al-Fatihah</i> and <i>Surah al-Ikhlās</i> (4.2.1), the Beautiful Names of Allah: <i>Ar-Rahman</i>, <i>Ar-Rahim</i>, and <i>Al-Malik</i> (4.5), the two testimonies of faith (4.6), pray correctly and clearly before and after learning (4.7), and memorize <i>Surah Al-Fatihah</i> and <i>Surah Al-Ikhlās</i> accurately and clearly (4.2.2).</p> <p>Narrate the stories of exemplary prophets (Adam, Prophet Idris, Prophet Nuh, Prophet Hud, and Prophet Muhammad, peace be upon them).</p>
Reflection and Creativity	<p>Present evidence of the existence of Allah, the Most Merciful and Compassionate (4.3), and the oneness of Allah (4.4).</p> <p>Practice the procedures of ablution (4.11), perform prayer and engage in religious activities in their surroundings (4.12.1), and participate in religious activities in their surroundings (4.12.2).</p> <p>Exhibit behavior of respect and obedience towards parents and teachers (4.8), speak in a good, polite, and courteous manner (4.9), demonstrate gratitude, forgiveness, honesty, and self-confidence (4.10).</p>

2. Comparison of Student Textbooks and Teacher's Books

From a legal perspective, the Student Textbook and Teacher's Book are the tangible embodiments of government regulations (Government Regulation No. 32/2013). The significance of these regulations is further reinforced in Article 1 [22-3] and Article 43, which emphasize the accessibility of textbooks to the general public. The Student Textbook assumes the role of the "primary learning resource that enables students to acquire the essential core competencies and fundamental knowledge" (Article 1 [22-3]). On the other hand, the Teacher's Book serves as a comprehensive "guide comprising teaching strategies, methods, techniques, and assessments for each subject and/or learning theme." In this analysis, the focus lies on the examination of the Student Textbook and Teacher's Book specifically titled "Islamic Religious Education and Character Education," which were officially published by the Ministry of Education in 2014 (Kemendikbud, 2014).

a. The General Structure of the Islamic Religious Education Student Textbook

The structure of the Islamic Religious Education textbook begins with an introduction provided by the Ministry of Education and the authors. The book is authored by Achmad Hasim and Otong Jaelani, with no affiliation or association with any specific Islamic religious institution, such as MUI. The book is supervised by the Curriculum and Book Development Center, Research and Development Agency, Ministry of Education and Culture. The introduction of the Islamic Religious Education textbook is written by the authors. The Introduction section of this book provides a brief overview (1 page) of the 2013 curriculum, as well as the purpose and objectives of writing the Teacher's Book. In the introduction of the Islamic Religious Education textbook, it is stated that the purpose of writing the Teacher's Book is *"to provide guidance for teachers of Islamic Religious Education and Character Education in planning, implementing, and assessing the teaching and learning process of Islamic Religious Education and Character Education"* (Kemendikbud, 2014). Through this book, it is expected that the teaching and learning of Islamic Religious Education will achieve optimal outcomes and align with the national educational objectives, which aim to *"develop the potential of learners to become individuals who have faith and piety towards the One God, possess noble character, are healthy, knowledgeable, competent, creative, independent, and become democratic and responsible citizens"* (p. vii).

From a structural perspective, the Islamic Religious Education textbook for students encompasses the educational content that they are expected to acquire over the course of an academic year, spanning approximately 36 to 40 weeks. Each chapter within the Islamic Religious Education textbook is further subdivided into distinct sub-chapters. The composition of each chapter in the Islamic Religious Education textbook includes the following elements: (1) Learning Material, which provides the substantive subject matter, (2) My Attitude, aimed at instilling in learners the integration of acquired knowledge into their behavior, (3) Let's Do It, comprising activities designed to facilitate the comprehension of the material, (4) Insha Allah I Can, offering challenges to inspire learners to demonstrate their capability in performing tasks, (5) Let's Practice, serving as an assessment mechanism to gauge learners' mastery of the covered material, and (6) Parent's Comment, providing an avenue for parental feedback and involvement (Kemendikbud, 2014).

The Islamic Religious Education textbook encompasses a diverse range of materials that are assumed to pertain to the scope of Islamic Religious Education. However, the explicit mention of this scope is absent in both the introductory sections of the student and teacher books. The introductory section of the teacher's book merely asserts that *"In the framework of Islamic teachings, moral education holds paramount importance. Firming up faith serves as the bedrock, while worship acts as the means, ultimately aiming at the cultivation of noble character..."* (p. vi). To ascertain the scope of Islamic Religious Education, reference can be made to the Minister of Religious Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia Decree No. 211 of 2011, which provides guidelines for the development of the National Standard of Islamic Religious Education in schools.

Based on the letter, four fundamental aspects of Islamic Religious Education are established, namely the study of the Qur'an and Hadith, Creed (*Aqidah*), Morality (*Akhlak*), Jurisprudence/Worship (*Fiqh/Ibadah*), as well as History (*Tarikh*). It is further emphasized that at the elementary school level, the curriculum specifically focuses on the aspects of the Qur'an,

Morality, Faith, and Worship. The structure of the Islamic Religious Education textbook is believed to be based on these four aspects, encompassing the study of the Qur'an and Hadith, Creed, Morality, Jurisprudence/Worship, and History.

Within each chapter of the Islamic Religious Education Teacher's Book, there are outlined Core Competencies, Basic Competencies, Learning Indicators, Learning Processes, Assessment, Enrichment, Remedial measures, and the crucial Interaction between teachers and parents. The Teacher's Book provides explicit instructions for utilizing the material during the learning process, which entails thorough preparation and effective implementation. This section presents concise guidelines for teachers, such as commencing the lesson with a greeting and joint prayer, prompting learners to observe illustrations depicting Allah's creations in the textbook, and other relevant instructions to facilitate engaging and meaningful instruction.

b. Presentation Structure of the Islamic Religious Education Textbook

The Islamic Religious Education textbook follows a systematic approach in presenting religious content, aligning with the established basic competencies outlined in the 2013 curriculum. While the content itself is determined by authorized institutions, the presentation style adopted in the textbook reflects the inherent nature of religious practice. In this section, we will elucidate the sequential flow of presenting religious content within the Islamic Religious Education textbook, with specific emphasis on subjects such as the teachings of faith (*Aqidah*) and the cultivation of noble character (*Akhlak*).

1) Flow of Presentation of Theological Aspects

In the Islamic Religious Education textbook, a content analysis of the "*Mapping of Content Competencies and Basic Competencies*" reveals that the aspect of Creed (*Aqidah*) holds the largest share compared to other aspects. This can be observed in Table 3 presented below.

Table 3. Mapping of Content and Basic Competencies in Islamic Religious Education

No	Aspects	Total	Percentages
1	Faith/ <i>Aqidah</i>	27	35,5
2	The Qur'an	9	11,8
3	Worship/ <i>Ibadah</i>	9	11,8
4	Morality/ <i>Akhlak</i>	9	11,8
5	Morality based on Faith	15	19,7
6	Morality based on the Qur'an	3	4
7	Faith based on the Qur'an	2	2,7
		76	

The subject of Creed (*Aqidah*) takes precedence in the Grade 1 Islamic Religious Education textbook for Elementary School. This is evident from the significant number of Basic Competencies, constituting 35.5% of the overall content of the Islamic Religious Education book when considered independently, or 57.9% when aggregated. The second prominent topic in the Grade 1 Islamic Religious Education book is Morality (*Akhlak*),

accounting for 11.8% of the content independently, or a cumulative 35.5% when taken into account holistically.

Within the realm of Islamic Religious Education, theological discussions revolve around the belief in Allah and the Prophet Muhammad. In Lesson 1 of the Student Book, the topic covered is “Compassion,” featuring sub-topics on “Compassion of the Prophet Muhammad” and “Compassion of Allah.” The placement of the description regarding the “Compassion of the Prophet Muhammad” prior to the “Compassion of Allah” suggests an emphasis on exemplifying the character of the Prophet Muhammad, rather than focusing directly on faith in Allah. Nevertheless, it should be noted that references to the Prophet Muhammad are limited to only a few pages in reality.

Table 4. Theological Terms in the Islamic Religious Education Book

Words	Total	Pages
Muhammad the Messenger of Allah, the Messenger of Allah, the Prophet Muhammad (peace be upon him), the Prophet, the Messenger, the four attributes of a Prophet, Prophet Muhammad, and the Prophet (peace be upon him).	16	2, 3, 31, 33, 55, 56, 68, 75
Allah Swt (the Most Glorious and Exalted)	33	12, 15, 16, 17, 18, 19, 21, 31, 33, 34, 35, 36, 39, 45, 54, 55, 66, 71
Allah	17	2, 16, 34, 41, 42, 51, 52, 54, 55, 56, dan 61
Allah, the Supreme King	5	53, 54
Allah, the One and Only	4	18,51,52

Prophet Muhammad is depicted as an exemplar figure on only two occasions, namely as a loving figure towards children and as a forgiving figure (Ministry of Education and Culture, 2013). The descriptions of Prophet Muhammad are not extensively featured, even during the presentation of the two sentences of the Shahada (pp. 55-56). The frequency of mentions of the Quran exceeds that of Prophet Muhammad, with Prophet Muhammad being mentioned 16 times and the Quran (including Quranic verses) being mentioned 33 times. Similarly, the mention of Allah’s name (including variations such as Allah, Allah SWT, Allah the One and Only, Allah the Supreme King) is predominant, totaling 59 occurrences.

The position of Prophet Muhammad in Islamic theology is certainly distinct from that of Jesus and Mary in Christian theology, but the limited mention of Prophet Muhammad in the teachings of Islam indicates an orientation that undermines his theological significance. Conversely, the greater occurrence of the word “Quran” compared to “Muhammad” (33 to 16) can serve as a basis for evaluating the religious orientation of the Islamic Religious Education book, which centers around textual sources.

To foster faith in the existence of God, the Islamic Religious Education book presents propositions of faith without initiating a process of critical thinking or establishing a connection to experiential evidence. For instance, Lesson 3 (Faith in Allah SWT) and Lesson 8 (Allah SWT, the Supreme King). Lesson 3 comprises two topics: “Believing in the Existence of Allah” and “Allah is the One and Only”. These topics, encompassing Allah’s existence and

unity, hold fundamental significance within the Islamic theological framework. The first topic is presented across two pages.

On the first page of the Islamic Religious Education textbook, there is a narrative that includes the title sentence “Faith in Allah SWT,” the sentence “It is incumbent upon us to believe in Allah,” a sub-heading titled “Believing in the Existence of Allah SWT,” the sentence “Allah SWT created the universe for humanity,” an instructional sentence “Observe and describe the following picture! Formulate questions based on your observations!”, and an illustrated depiction of a natural landscape (Kemendikbud, 2014).

On the subsequent page, there is a section called “My Attitude” which contains the statement “I believe and am certain that Allah exists,” accompanied by the song “My Religion is Islam” (sung to the tune of “Topi Saya Bundar”). The lyrics of the song are as follows:

My religion is Islam, Islam is my religion
If it is not Islam, it is not my religion
My God is one, one God for me
If it is not one, it is not my God
My God is Allah, Allah is my God
If it is not Allah, it is not my God

On the same page, there is a column titled “Let’s Do It” instructing students to mention the creations of Allah SWT. Below it, there is a column titled “God willing, I can” containing the following statements: (1) I believe in the existence of Allah SWT, (2) I believe that this universe is the creation of Allah SWT, (3) I have a responsibility to take care of the environment, and (4) I express gratitude to Allah SWT. At the end of each statement, there are columns labeled “not yet” and “already.” Furthermore, at the bottom, there is a column titled “I Practice” with sentences that need to be completed. The achievement indicators for this topic include: accepting the existence of Allah SWT (1.31), demonstrating self-confidence (2.31), mentioning (3.31), explaining (3.32), expressing (4.31), and demonstrating (4.32) evidence of the existence of Allah SWT [32].

These two pages do not contain any sentences indicating how students can rationally understand their belief in Allah. The only material provided is the song about my religion, Islam, which states that God is one, Allah is my God. Following that, there are instructions for students to perform specific tasks. The section that allows for the presentation of explanations about belief in the existence of Allah is found in the “I Practice” column, where students are prompted to fill in the blanks in the following sentences:

- (1) The universe is evidence of the existence of ...
- (2) Allah SWT created the universe for ...
- (3) We must ... because we were created by Allah
- (4) We worship because of our faith in ...

The aforementioned sentence indicates an endeavor to guide students towards filling in the term “universe” for the initial blanks, followed by “human” or “worship,” “gratitude,” and “Allah” subsequently. The intention behind these statements is to argue for the existence of Allah based on the presence of the universe, a theological doctrine formulated within *Kalam*. However, arriving at such a conclusion necessitates a multifaceted thought process. Consequently, it can be deduced that the presentation format employed in the Islamic Religious

Education student book inadequately stimulates students to form theological arguments regarding “the universe’s existence as evidence of Allah’s presence.”

In the second topic, titled “Allah SWT is One,” the presentation of the material fails to establish a correlation with the topic heading. This section involves self-observation, contemplation of one’s home and surroundings, culminating in attitudes of gratitude towards Allah SWT for possessing bodily faculties and a steadfast belief in Allah’s Oneness. The “I Can” column, ascertained through “not yet” and “already” markers, pertains to expressing gratitude to Allah (for the blessings of the body and family) and experiencing joy (in learning and having friends). Conversely, the “God willing, I can” column encompasses inquiries concerning the five senses, the functions of the eyes, and the necessity of exhibiting kindness towards parents, siblings, and teachers. Regrettably, no cohesive explanation is provided to bridge the concept of “the Oneness of Allah” with the behavior of expressing gratitude for the bestowed blessings of the body, companions, parents, teachers, and the environment. A similar situation arises in lesson 8, which revolves around the two Shahada statements. The two Shahada statements are presented solely for recitation and memorization purposes. Subsequently, in the “God willing, I can” section, students are required to confirm their belief in the statements “I believe Allah is my God” and “I believe Muhammad is my prophet and messenger” using the response options “yes” or “no” (Kemendikbud, 2017).

The instructional materials presented in student textbooks are inherently limited, as they are designed to align with the students’ comprehension level. Consequently, the Teacher’s Book assumes a pivotal role in bridging this gap. The Situational Book effectively complements the teacher’s aptitude in conveying the material. The methodologies employed by the teacher to deliver the content can be gleaned from the Teacher’s Book. Within the Islamic Religious Education Teacher’s Book, the following descriptions are provided:

- 1) The teacher prompts students to carefully observe the illustrations depicting the divine creations in the textbook.
- 2) Students articulate their interpretations and understanding of the visual depictions.
- 3) The teacher supplements the material with additional explanations and reinforces the concepts based on both the textbook content and the students’ responses.
- 4) In the “My Attitude” section, the teacher instructs students to collectively recite “I believe Allah exists” as a means of reinforcing the lesson’s elucidation.
- 5) The teacher guides the students in singing the provided song titled “My Religion is Islam,” set to the tune of “Round Hat.”
- 6) Students collaborate in pairs (with their desk partner) to engage with the activities in the “Let’s Do It” section.
- 7) In the “God willing, I can” column, the teacher directs students to indicate their responses with [checklists] in the respective “yes” or “no” columns (Kemendikbud, 2017).

The instructional guide for teachers lacks specific directives for formulating statements that effectively connect the content through sentences and illustrations. The Teacher’s Book merely outlines the required actions without providing guidance on their execution. Similarly, in the Islamic Religious Education book, the material is presented without incorporating verses from the Holy Qur’an or narratives of the Prophets. Instead, the emphasis is predominantly

placed on logical reasoning, placing a significant burden on the teacher’s expertise and knowledge.

Table 5. Lesson Material, Insertions, and Conclusion Structures

Lesson/Material	Insertions of Sacred Scripture/Prophetic Stories	Conclusions Formed
Lesson 1: Topic: Compassion	Allah, the Most Gracious, the Most Merciful (Quran 1:1)	-
Material 1: The Compassion of Prophet Muhammad	The story of Prophet Muhammad’s compassion towards orphaned children during <i>Eid Al-Fitr</i>	I invoke blessings upon the Prophet, who serves as my exemplary figure, and I consistently engage in sharing and assisting my friends.
Material 2: The Compassion of Allah	Not applicable	I hold deep affection for my family and friends. I have committed to memory the phrase “ <i>Ar-Rahman Ar-Rahim</i> ” (The Most Gracious, The Most Merciful).
Lesson 2: The Love for the Quran	Not applicable	I derive pleasure from the act of reading the Quran, which serves as the sacred scripture of the Islamic community.
Material 1: Reading the Basmalah (In the Name of Allah)	Not applicable	Prior to commencing any endeavor, I initiate with the recitation of the <i>basmalah</i> .
Material 2: Reciting <i>Surah Al-Fatihah</i> (The Opening Chapter)	Not applicable	I proficiently recite <i>Surah Al-Fatihah</i> independently.
Material 3: Memorizing <i>Surah Al-Fatihah</i>	Not applicable	I have successfully memorized <i>Surah Al-Fatihah</i> .
Material 4: Understanding the Message of <i>Surah Al-Fatihah</i>	Not applicable	<i>Surah Al-Fatihah</i> encapsulates a profound message regarding the compassion of Allah SWT, urging us to demonstrate obedience and persistently seek blessings from Allah Swt.
Material 4: Pronunciation of Arabic Letters and Their Diacritical Marks	Not applicable	I derive great satisfaction from articulating the Arabic alphabet.
Lesson 3: Faith in Allah Swt	We are obligated to have faith in Allah Swt	-

Material 1: Belief in the Existence of Allah	Not applicable	The existence of the universe serves as compelling evidence substantiating the presence of Allah. Allah SWT skillfully fashioned the universe with the purpose of facilitating worship. Our obligation to engage in worship arises from our profound faith in Allah.
Material 2: The Oneness of Allah Swt	Not applicable	I firmly believe and hold unwavering certainty in the Oneness of Allah.

In the aforementioned table, the delivery of Islamic Religious Education in teaching the concept of “Believing in the Existence of Allah” is predominantly based on logical reasoning, specifically the premise that the existence of creation implies the existence of a Creator. Notably, there is an absence of Quranic verses or sacred stories incorporated into the teaching approach, placing significant emphasis on the teacher’s delivery skills. Furthermore, the teacher’s book lacks specific guidelines on how to effectively present this logical reasoning (Kemendikbud, 2017).

2) *Presentation Flow of Moral Values/Virtuous Behavior*

Regarding the presentation flow of moral values and virtuous behavior, the Islamic Religious Education book portrays virtuous behavior as a natural consequence of faith. The topic of personal hygiene is addressed in a dedicated chapter, recognizing it as a vital competence for first-grade students in Elementary School. The discussion on personal hygiene commences with the affirmation that “Allah loves those who are clean and pure.” It is followed by instructional materials covering (1) the meaning of purification and (2) various methods of purification. Following comprehension assessments and familiarization with these materials, subsequent sections expound on (3) the procedures of purification and culminate in (4) the significance of leading a clean life. The exploration of Personal Hygiene commences with the elucidation of Fiqh thaharah (as evident in materials 1, 2, and 3), ultimately encouraging students to cultivate the trait of maintaining cleanliness.

Notably, the preceding Islamic Religious Education materials prior to the lesson on “Living a Clean Life” exhibit a lack of coherence, thus failing to establish a solid foundation for the development of a “clean living” attitude among students. The sole material relating to the human body is encountered within the lesson “Oneness of Allah SWT,” serving as the second material in the preceding lesson. In this particular material, students are encouraged to engage in interactive activities, such as inquiring about the names and benefits of various body parts from their peers. The objective is to foster the realization that “Allah SWT created all of them,” thereby instilling a sense of gratitude towards Allah SWT for the bestowment of body parts.

3. Islamic Education and Indoctrination

Indoctrination occurs in the realm of education when the imparted knowledge assumes an “irrational” character, lacking sufficient substantiation that can neither be verified nor refuted (Thiessen, 1993; 1985; Scruton et al., 1985). This applies particularly to teachings encompassing religious statements and institutionalized doctrines. The present study aims to primarily examine the nature of the taught material, assessing whether it is grounded in rational thinking and supported by empirical evidence. Additionally, the study focuses on the methodology employed in the dissemination of religious content. A teaching method becomes indoctrinative when it fails to furnish adequate reasoning, evidence, or arguments to support the material being taught or when it veils the reasons and bypasses rational discourse (Hull, 1984). Such indoctrinative materials and methods impede the intended purpose of religious education, which seeks to foster independent thinking, open-mindedness (Scruton et al., 1985; Hare, 2007), and the cultivation of “critical openness.”

Regarding the content itself, the Islamic Religious Education book imposes a significantly heavier workload compared to other religious textbooks like Christian Religious Education. This discrepancy may arise from divergent interpretations of core competencies. Islamic Religious Education translates the core competencies into 68 basic components, whereas Christian Religious Education encompasses only 24 basic competencies. Consequently, the Islamic Religious Education book bears an “excessive burden” relative to its counterparts in religious education. This circumstance consequently affects the learning process. Consequently, several subjects within Islamic Religious Education are presented in a cumulative manner, which indicates a teaching methodology that fails to adequately consider students’ receptiveness. The lack of time allocated for students to fully digest a single topic can lead to indoctrination, whereby a singular perspective is imposed upon students without affording them the opportunity to critically engage with the subject matter.

Moreover, Islamic Religious Education encompasses a significant emphasis on memorization. This emphasis extends beyond the mere memorization of Quranic verses and prayers, as students are also required to commit to memory the rituals of worship and the narratives of the 25 Prophets. For instance, first-grade students at the Elementary School level are “expected” to memorize *Surah Al-Fatihah* and *Surah Al-Ikhlās* without being provided any rationale for the necessity of this memorization. The narratives of the 25 Prophets are conveyed through a gradual process, whereby students are tasked with memorizing the names of the prophets, starting from Prophet Adam, Idris, Nuh, Hud, and culminating in Prophet Muhammad. These numerous memorization requirements undermine the establishment of a robust connection between faith-based instruction and rational reasoning.

Regarding the nature of the educational material itself, which lacks opportunities for critical thinking and substantiation through evidence, the Islamic Religious Education book exhibits a significantly stronger proclivity towards indoctrination compared to other religious education textbooks. It tends to foster closed-mindedness and discourage a critical approach among students towards the subject matter. The song “Agamaku Islam” (sung to the tune of “*My Hat is Round*”) exemplifies this closed-mindedness, as it imposes Islam as the religion, enforces the concept of a singular God, and insists that God must exclusively be identified as Allah. Each aspect is forcefully conveyed and accentuated through phrases such as “If not Islam, it is not my religion,” “If not one, not my God,” and “If not Allah, not my God.” In

contrast, for instance, the Christian Religious Education book does not present material proclaiming “Christianity as the religion,” let alone asserting that it is not one’s religion if not Christianity.

The presentation of material in the absence of logical reasoning and empirical evidence poses challenges to the effective comprehension of fundamental Islamic teachings by students. Key theological concepts, such as the oneness of Allah and the declaration of faith (syahadat), are inadequately addressed, presented as mere statements devoid of serious consideration. These concepts are conveyed without rational justifications or substantiating evidence from real-life contexts. Nonetheless, Islamic theology provides a plethora of arguments that could be utilized in teaching. The topic of “syahadat,” which serves as a determinant of one’s adherence to Islam, lacks logical reasoning and supporting evidence. Explanations addressing crucial questions like the significance of proclaiming the syahadat and its directed focus on Allah and Muhammad are entirely absent, particularly in the context of first-grade students in Elementary School (Thiessen, 1985).

It is important to note that logical reasoning for children possesses distinct characteristics and differs from that of adults (Autio, 2013, Copp, 2016). For instance, theological arguments that emphasize “the presence of nature as evidence of Allah” cannot be readily comprehended by first-grade students in Elementary School. Consequently, both in terms of content and methodology, the Islamic Religious Education book essentially imposes Islamic teachings upon students as unquestionable dogma. The book heavily relies on rote memorization as a teaching method for conveying Islamic doctrines. Conversely, other religious education materials predominantly employ meaningful experiential approaches that involve children’s physicality, their environment, and narratives derived from sacred scriptures. The Islamic Religious Education book also imposes the obligation to introduce first-grade students to practices such as prayer (*salat*), fasting (*shawm*), and others. Additional acts of worship are deferred to subsequent grades or, perhaps, to Junior High School and Senior High School levels. This creates an impression that the Islamic Religious Education book is characterized by haste, where all the material must be covered and mastered by students starting from the first grade of Elementary School. This condition reflects a decision that restricts the teaching methods employed in Islamic Religious Education, thereby depriving students of the opportunity to develop their reasoning capabilities in relation to their faith (Coulson, 2004).

In the Islamic Religious Education book, the presentation of the material lacks depth and reinforcement. While the authors of the book make some efforts, such as incorporating songs that convey educational content and encouraging observations of the body and environment, these elements are not adequately integrated into a pedagogical framework. If indoctrination is defined as the concealment and bypassing of reasoning, then it can be argued that the materials in Islamic Religious Education possess an indoctrinative nature when compared to other religious education materials. If indoctrination occurs when the form or process hinders the child’s critical thinking, the curriculum and the Islamic Religious Education book also demonstrate signs of such tendencies. As a result, it is suspected that the teachings of Islam are acquired primarily through rote memorization, without fostering critical thinking. If the content being memorized tends to involve the denial of others, then the learning or indoctrination within Islamic Religious Education has the potential to cultivate intolerance among students.

D. CONCLUSION

Religious education inevitably involves elements of indoctrination. The crux of the issue lies not in the process of indoctrination itself, but rather in its resulting effects. Caution should be exercised when indoctrination obstructs students from developing critical thinking skills necessary for accepting certain materials. This can create a situation where religious teachings become dogmatic and resistant to evolving awareness, potentially fostering a mindset that views anything divergent as erroneous and in need of eradication. An analysis of the curriculum and teaching materials used in Islamic Religious Education reveals the following conclusions:

Firstly, the 2013 curriculum for Islamic Religious Education exhibits a dense compilation of materials and an extensive scope of topics to be taught. The adaptation of the Core Curriculum into the Basic Curriculum, devised by the Curriculum Center of the Ministry of Education and Culture, places a disproportionately heavy burden on Islamic Religious Education in comparison to other religious education subjects. This burden permeates both student textbooks and teacher guidebooks, with Islamic Religious Education textbooks containing a larger volume of teaching materials for students to absorb compared to other religious education teacher guidebooks. Consequently, the 2013 curriculum tends to foster rote memorization of Islamic teachings without necessarily promoting deeper comprehension.

Secondly, the structure of the Islamic Religious Education textbooks and teacher guidebooks encourages students to unquestioningly accept Islamic teachings, without active engagement in critical thinking or consideration of supporting evidence. This tendency renders Islamic Religious Education books susceptible to potentially dangerous indoctrination, as they discourage the cultivation of critical thinking skills in the process of accepting religious teachings.

Thirdly, in the implementation of the 2013 curriculum, the government provides teacher guidebooks in addition to student textbooks. However, the Islamic Religious Education teacher guidebooks offer concise explanations lacking clear guidance. This less comprehensive approach to teaching Islamic Religious Education presents opportunities for teachers to steer the curriculum according to their personal religious orientations. Consequently, there is an inherent risk of teachers inadvertently promoting negative religious practices through indoctrination. In light of these observations, it is crucial to critically evaluate and address the potential for indoctrination within the realm of religious education.

REFERENCES

- Autio, T. (2013). The Internationalization of Curriculum Research. In W. F. Pinar (ed.), *International Handbook of Curriculum Research, 2nd ed.* New York: Routledge, pp. 17–31.
- Copley, T. (2005). *Indoctrination, education and God: The struggle for the mind.* London: SPCK Publishing.
- Copp, D. (2016). Moral education versus indoctrination. *Theory Res. Educ.*, 14(2), 149–167. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1477878516656563>
- Coulson, A. J. (2004). Education and indoctrination in the muslim world: Is there a problem? What can we do about it? *Policy Analysis*, 2004. <https://www.cato.org/policy-analysis/education-indoctrination-muslim-world-there-problem-what-can-we-do-about-it>
- Diwan, I. & Vartanova, I. (2020). Does education indoctrinate?. *Int. J. Educ. Dev.*, 78, 1–13. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijedudev.2020.102249>
- Hare, W. (2007). Ideological indoctrination and teacher education. *J. Educ. Controv.*, 2(2), 1–6. Available at: <https://cedar.wvu.edu/jec/vol2/iss2/5>
- Hull, J. M. (1984). *Studies in religion and education.* London: Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9780429052620>
- Kazepides, T. (1983). Is religious education possible? A rejoinder to W.D. Hudson. *J. Philos. Educ.*, 17(2), 250–265. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-9752.1983.tb00037.x>
- Kazepides, T. Educating, socialising and indoctrinating. *J. Philos. Educ.*, 16(2), 155–165. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-9752.1982.tb00608.x>
- Kemendikbud. (2014). *Pendidikan agama Islam dan budi pekerti.* Jakarta: Kemendikbud.
- Kemendikbud. (2017). *Teacher's book for Islamic religious education.* Jakarta: Kemendikbud.
- Lewin, D. (2022). Indoctrination. *J. Philos. Educ.*, 56(4), 612–626. <https://doi.org/10.1111/1467-9752.12668>
- Lundgren, H., Bang, A., Justice, S., & Marsick, V. (2017). Conceptualizing reflection in experience-based workplace learning. *Hum. Resour. Dev. Int.*, 20(1), 1–22. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13678868.2017.1308717>
- Meynell, H. A. (2006). Moral education and indoctrination. *J. Moral Educ.*, 4(1), 17–26. <https://doi.org/10.1080/0305724740040103>
- Null, W. (2017). *Curriculum, from theory to practice.* New York: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers.
- Parker, L (2016). Religious environmental education? The new school curriculum in Indonesia. *Environ. Educ. Res.*, 23(9), 1249–1272. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13504622.2016.1150425>
- PPIM. (2017). *Api dalam sekam. Keberagamaan generasi Z: Survei Nasional tentang sikap keberagamaan di sekolah dan universitas di Indonesia.* Jakarta: Universitas Islam Negeri Syarif Hidayatullah.
- Raihani, R. (2017). Education for multicultural citizens in Indonesia: Policies and practices. *Comp. A J. Comp. Int. Educ.*, 1–18. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03057925.2017.1399250>
- Raihani. (2011). A whole-school approach: A proposal for education for tolerance in Indonesia. *Theory Res. Educ.*, 9(1), 23–39. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1477878510394806>
- Saud, U. & Johnston, M. (2006). Cross-cultural influences on teacher education reform: Reflections on implementing the integrated curriculum in Indonesia. *J. Educ. Teach.*, 32(1), 3–20. <https://doi.org/10.1080/02607470500510894>
- Schreier, M. (2012). *Qualitative content analysis in practice.* London: SAGE Publications, Inc.
- Schubert, W. H. (1986). *Curriculum: Perspective, paradigm, and possibility.* New York: Macmillan Publishing Company.
- Scruton, R., Ellis-Jones, A. & O'Keefe, D. (1985). *Education and indoctrination.* Harrow: Education Research Centre.
- Tan, C. (2004). Michael Hand, indoctrination and the inculcation of belief. *J. Philos. Educ.*,

- 38(2), 257–267. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.0309-8249.2004.00380.x>
- Tan, C. (2011). *Islamic education and indoctrination: The case in Indonesia*. New York: Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9780203817766>
- Thiessen, E. J. (1985). Initiation, indoctrination, and education. *Can. J. Educ.*, 10(3), 229–249. <https://doi.org/10.2307/1494324>
- Thiessen, E. J. (1993). *Teaching for commitment: Liberal education, indoctrination, and christian nurture*. New York: McGill-Queen's Press.
- van den Akker, J. (2006). Introducing educational design research. In T. Plomp and N. Nieveen (eds.) *Educational design research*. Netherland: Netherlands Institute for Curriculum Development, pp. 37–52.