

Date Received : December 2025
Date Revised : May 2026
Date Accepted : May 2026
Date Published : May 2026

EVALUATION OF THE HOLISTIC EDUCATION BASED LEARNING PROGRAM AT THE INTEGRATED ISLAMIC HIGH SCHOOL

A. Mustika Abidin ¹

Universitas Islam Negeri Alauddin Makassar, Indonesia (a.mustika@uin-alauddin.ac.id)

Misykat Malik Ibrahim

Universitas Islam Negeri Alauddin Makassar, Indonesia

St. Syamsudduha

Universitas Islam Negeri Alauddin Makassar, Indonesia

Ilyas Ismail

Universitas Islam Negeri Alauddin Makassar, Indonesia

Sitti Mania

Universitas Islam Negeri Alauddin Makassar, Indonesia

Nur Syamsiah

Universitas Islam Negeri Alauddin Makassar, Indonesia

Muh. Rapi

Universitas Islam Negeri Alauddin Makassar, Indonesia

¹ Correspondence author

Keywords:

Process Evaluation;
Program Evaluation;
Learning;
Holistic Education.

ABSTRACTS

This study aims to evaluate the process of holistic education based learning programs at SMAIT Al-Fityan School Gowa. The research focuses on learning development, learning integration, teacher strategies, student responses, learning interactions, and the use of methods. This study employs an evaluative research design using a mixed-methods approach with an explanatory sequential design. Quantitative data collection and analysis were conducted first through the distribution of questionnaires to 30 students, followed by qualitative data collection through interviews with 3 teachers and 6 students to gain a more comprehensive understanding. The findings indicate that the evaluation of the holistic education-based learning program at SMAIT Al-Fityan School Gowa showed that 73.3% of the outcomes were at the “sufficiently achieved” or “fairly good” level. The learning process has developed students’ knowledge, attitudes, skills, and character; integrated various dimensions of holistic education namely intellectual, emotional, physical, social, and spiritual dimensions; employed varied learning strategies; created a pleasant classroom atmosphere; and strengthened student interactions. However, the implementation of the learning process still faces challenges, particularly in developing students’ skills, integrating physical aspects, and maintaining consistency in learning strategies. This study concludes that holistic education-based learning is important to implement in the classroom because it emphasizes the holistic and integrated development of students, encompassing intellectual, emotional, social, spiritual, and physical aspects. This approach views the learning process not merely as the transfer of knowledge, but as the process of forming the whole person, which takes place within specific social, cultural, and value systems.

A. INTRODUCTION

Education plays a vital role in national development. Through education, individuals are nurtured who can contribute to the nation using their potential and talents. To foster such individuals, education receives special attention. According to Law of the Republic of Indonesia Number 20 of 2003, Article 1, Paragraph 1, on the National Education System, education is a conscious and planned effort to create a learning environment and learning process so that students actively develop their potential to possess religious spiritual strength, self-control, personality, intelligence, and the skills required by themselves, society, the nation, and the state (Law of the Republic of Indonesia No. 20 of 2003, on the National Education System, 2003). This law establishes that education serves as a venue for developing one’s potential in the areas of religious understanding, emotions, character, intelligence, noble ethics, and the skills needed to overcome ignorance and ensure survival.

However, the reality on the ground still reveals several issues in the field of education; for instance, there is critical scrutiny of educational institutions that are deemed not to have genuinely prioritized curriculum content and subject matter oriented toward values. This situation leads to an imbalance in the educational process, where the development of cognitive aspects tends to be the primary focus, while there is a lack of attention to the development of students’ values, personality, and spirituality (Sinthiya & Rahman, 2022). Even in teaching practices, a child’s success is viewed solely through the lens of academic achievement. Meanwhile, ethical, moral, and character

values receive insufficient serious attention. Consequently, even though students may excel in terms of their intelligence quotient (IQ), they face a deeply concerning crisis in their emotional quotient (EQ) and character development (Makmudi, 2022).

Given the challenges facing the education sector as outlined above, appropriate development is needed to restore public trust in education in Indonesia. Holistic education is a wise response to today's ecological, cultural, and moral challenges, aimed at empowering young people as the next generation to live wisely and responsibly within society. Through holistic education, every aspect of learning involves a comprehensive and balanced effort to develop each student, encompassing spiritual, moral, imaginative, intellectual, cultural, aesthetic, emotional, and physical dimensions all directed toward achieving an awareness of their relationship with Allah SWT, which is the ultimate purpose of all human life.

Holistic education based learning is a learning program that emphasizes the holistic and integrated development of students, encompassing intellectual, emotional, social, spiritual, and physical aspects (Forbes, 2003). Holistic education aims to develop individuals with a comprehensive awareness, oriented toward humanistic values such as peace, love, and knowledge (Mahmoudi et al., 2012). This indicates that the learning process is not only focused on mastering academic content but is also directed toward the formation of character and value awareness, enabling students to develop in a balanced manner and contribute positively to social life.

In line with this perspective, holistic educational practices view education as a multilevel process of cultivating students, encompassing intellectual, emotional, social, physical, and spiritual development. Through comprehensively designed learning, education is believed to be capable of producing individuals who develop harmoniously and in a balanced manner, both as individuals and as social beings. Therefore, education must not be oriented solely toward academic achievement but must also emphasize the holistic development of students' character, values, and humanity (Zamroni, 2014).

Illeris's theory of the three dimensions of learning namely, the content dimension, the incentive dimension, and the interaction dimension serves as a key framework for implementing holistic education-based learning. This theory posits that learning is an integrated process that simultaneously involves cognitive, emotional, and social aspects. The content dimension relates to knowledge, attitudes, and skills, which education should be able to provide to students. The incentive dimension relates to motivation, where education should take into account students' psychological conditions. The interaction dimension relates to social relationships or interactions, where education is effective when there is action, communication, and cooperation between teachers and students. These three dimensions are necessary in learning to develop students' potential fully and comprehensively (Illeris, 2018).

SMAIT Al-Fityan School Gowa, as one of the educational institutions, is required to position itself as an agent of change in society, as it is an upper-secondary school based on Integrated Islam, where the school has a dual role: providing general education and Islamic religious education. This overarching goal is realized, in part, through a holistic education-based learning program an approach that develops all aspects of students' potential, including intellectual, emotional, physical, social, and spiritual

dimensions. Its purpose extends beyond cognitive development alone to encompass other aspects that influence students' personal growth. Therefore, it is crucial to evaluate the implementation of this holistic education-based learning program. Process evaluation is used to detect or predict the design of procedures or implementation plans during the implementation phase, to provide information for program decisions, and to serve as a record or archive of procedures that have taken place. Process evaluation involves the collection of predetermined assessment data applied in the practical implementation of the program in the field (Ananda & Rafida, 2017).

However, preliminary observations indicate that the implementation of holistic education-based learning, particularly regarding the development of students' physical aspects, has not yet been fully integrated into classroom teaching practices. Furthermore, although holistic education-based learning programs have been implemented at SMAIT Al-Fityan School Gowa, to date there has been no evaluative study that comprehensively examines the implementation process, particularly one that simultaneously integrates quantitative and qualitative approaches.

Previous studies have tended to focus on the concepts and implementation of holistic education in general, but few have specifically examined the evaluation of the implementation process of holistic education-based learning programs in integrated Islamic educational institutions. On the other hand, studies explicitly linking holistic educational practices with Islamic educational values such as character development, the balance between physical and spiritual aspects, and the integration of knowledge and faith remain relatively scarce.

In fact, from an Islamic educational perspective, the educational process is not only oriented toward the development of cognitive aspects but also encompasses the cultivation of moral character (*akhlaq al-karimah*), the purification of the soul (*tazkiyatun nafs*), and the strengthening of the relationship between humans and Allah SWT (*hablum minallah*) and fellow human beings (*hablum minannas*). These values align with the principles of holistic education, which emphasizes the development of the whole person in a balanced manner.

Based on this gap, this study aims to evaluate the implementation process of a holistic education-based learning program at SMAIT Al-Fityan School Gowa. This study is expected to contribute not only to the evaluation of educational programs but also to strengthening the integration of holistic education concepts and Islamic educational values in school learning practices.

B. METHOD

Penelitian This study employs a mixed-methods approach to integrate quantitative and qualitative data in order to provide a more comprehensive understanding of the evaluation process for holistic education-based learning programs at SMAIT Al-Fityan School in Gowa. The mixed-methods strategy employed is the sequential explanatory design (Creswell, 2014), in which quantitative data collection and analysis are conducted first through the distribution of questionnaires, followed by an in-depth exploration of qualitative data via interviews, observations, and document analysis.

Data sources in this study were selected using purposive sampling, which involves intentionally selecting participants based on specific criteria relevant to the research objectives. The criteria used in participant selection included: (1) direct involvement in the implementation of the holistic education-based learning program, (2) consistent experience in participating in or implementing the program, and (3) the ability to provide in-depth information regarding the ongoing learning process.

Based on these criteria, the research participants were selected as follows. In the quantitative phase, the respondents consisted of 30 eleventh-grade students selected based on their active participation in the learning program, with a composition of 15 female students and 15 male students to ensure balanced representation. Furthermore, in the qualitative phase, informants were selected in stages (follow-up selection) based on the quantitative data. A total of 6 students (4 female and 2 male) were selected from the questionnaire respondents by considering variations in their responses (high, moderate, and low) to obtain a more diverse and in-depth perspective.

In addition, the interviews also involved 3 eleventh-grade teachers: a teacher of Islamic Religious Education and Character Education (PAIBP), a teacher of Pancasila Education, and a teacher of Indonesian Language. The selection of teachers was based on the consideration that they were directly involved in the implementation of holistic education-based learning and had a comprehensive understanding of the learning process under study.

Data collection in this study utilized observation, interviews, questionnaires, and documentation to comprehensively gather field data regarding the evaluation of the learning process based on holistic education. The questionnaire in this study employed a Likert scale with 5 provided response options, namely:

Table 1 Likert Scale Scores

Response Options	Score
Strongly Agree = Strongly support the statement	5
Agree = Support the statement	4
Somewhat/Neutral = Somewhat support or neutral	3
Disagree = Do not support the statement	2
Strongly Disagree = Strongly disagree with the statement	1

The data analysis used was quantitative data analysis with scoring adapted from Azwar's method, which employs detailed ranges such as high, moderate, and low.

Table 2 Categorization of Respondent Responses

Score Value	Category
$X > (Mi + Sdi)$	High
$(Mi - Sdi) < X < (Mi + Sdi)$	Moderate
$X < (Mi - Sdi)$	Low

Notes:

X: Score

Mi: Mean

Sdi: Standard Deviation (Azwar, 2021).

Arithmetic measurements and data distribution were derived from the total scores of the questionnaire statements using *Microsoft Excel* and *SPSS software*. In addition to quantitative data analysis, this study also employs qualitative data analysis using the Miles and Huberman method (Miles et al., 2014), which involves three stages: (1) data reduction, conducted by selecting, focusing, and simplifying data from interviews, observations, and documentation relevant to the research focus; (2) data presentation, conducted in the form of descriptive narratives, matrices, or tables to facilitate the understanding of patterns and relationships among the data; and (3) drawing conclusions and verification, which is the process of continuously interpreting the meaning of the data by cross-checking the findings to ensure valid conclusions.

Furthermore, the integration of quantitative and qualitative data is carried out during the interpretation stage by comparing and linking the results of the analysis of these two types of data. Qualitative data are used to explain, reinforce, and provide context for quantitative findings, thereby yielding a more comprehensive understanding of the holistic education-based learning process under study.

C. RESULT AND DISCUSSION

The evaluation of the learning program process focused on three (3) main dimensions of holistic education: the content dimension, the incentive dimension, and the interaction dimension. The content dimension refers to the learning content or materials; it relates to knowledge, attitudes, and skills. The aspects evaluated include: learning development and learning integration. The incentive dimension focuses on or considers students' psychological aspects; it relates to motivation and encouragement. The aspects evaluated include: teacher strategies, and student responses as a direct result of the teacher's incentive strategies. The interaction dimension focuses on creating a conducive learning environment; it relates to social relationships/interactions. The aspects evaluated include: interactions during learning, and the use of methods.

The following presents the data from the descriptive analysis of the evaluation process, including the mean and standard deviation to facilitate the determination of the evaluation result categories for students.

Table 3 Results of Process Evaluation Data Analysis

Evaluated Aspects	N	Mean	Std. Deviation
Learning Development	30	4.60	.621
Learning Integration	30	4.33	.661
Teacher Strategies	30	4.30	.952
Student Response	30	4.27	.785
Learning Interaction	30	4.53	.571
Use of Methods	30	4.27	.907
Process Evaluation	30	26.30	3.687
Valid N (listwise)	30		

The table above presents the results of the evaluation of several aspects related to the evaluation of the learning program process, where each aspect was evaluated

based on the assessments of 30 respondents. The last column, namely *process* evaluation, shows the total score for all evaluated aspects, with a mean of 26.30 and a standard deviation of 3.687. Furthermore, the results are detailed in the descriptive evaluation table below.

Table 4 Descriptive Analysis of Evaluation Results

	Descriptive Statistics				
	N	Minimum	Max	Mean	Standard Deviation
Process Evaluation	30	12	30	26.30	3.687
Valid N (listwise)	30				

This table shows the evaluation results from 30 respondents. The total evaluation scores range from 12 (minimum) to 30 (maximum), with a mean of 26.30, indicating that respondents' ratings tend to be above the midpoint of the scale range; in other words, respondents' ratings are generally favorable and positive regarding the evaluated *process* aspects. A standard deviation of 3.687 indicates a fairly high level of variability in the respondents' ratings, meaning there are differing perspectives among respondents regarding the evaluated aspects.

Overall, although the average rating shows positive results, these findings also indicate that there is still significant variation among respondents. Therefore, the obtained data on the average score and standard deviation were subjected to further analysis to categorize the questionnaire results using Saifuddin Azwar's categorization: low, moderate, and high resulting in the following data:

Table 5 Evaluation Result Categories

Category Range	Interval	Frequency	Percent (%)	Category
$X < (Mi - Sdi)$	$X < 23$	2	6.7	Low
$(Mi - Sdi) < X < (Mi + Sdi)$	$23 < X < 30$	22	73.3	Moderate
$X > (Mi + Sdi)$	$X > 30$	6	20.0	Height
Total		30	100.0	

Respondents' answers were divided into three categories: low, moderate, and high. The range of values for each category was determined based on the mean (Mi) and standard deviation (Sdi), with values of $X < 23$ falling into the low category, $23 < X < 30$ falling into the moderate category, and $X > 30$ falling into the high category. From the data in the table above, it is known that there are 2 respondents (6.7%) in the low category, 22 respondents (73.3%) in the moderate category, and 6 respondents (20%) in the high category.

This data indicates that the largest percentage falls within the moderate category, namely 22 respondents (73.3%). This means that the evaluation results of the holistic education-based learning process at SMAIT Al-Fityan School Gowa are largely at a level that is **“sufficiently achieved” or “fairly good.”** This indicates that there are still

several aspects in the evaluation that require further attention (efforts to improve, strengthen, and adjust) so that all aspects of the learning process can run more optimally, consistently, and sustainably in achieving the goals of holistic education at the school.

The following is a further explanation of each dimension and aspect evaluated:

a. Content Dimension

1) Learning Development

Regarding the learning development aspect, the questionnaire statement posed was “the implementation of learning encompasses the development of my knowledge, attitudes, skills, and character formation in a comprehensive manner.” The results of the quantitative analysis/category distribution show that 66.7% (20 respondents) fell into the high category, 26.7% (8 respondents) rated it as moderate, and 6.7% (2 respondents) rated it as low. Conceptually, these findings indicate that the majority of students perceive learning as not only academically oriented but also touching on affective and character dimensions.

The results of interviews with teachers and students further support the quantitative findings that teachers do not merely present material theoretically but also connect it to real life situations and foster positive habits through programs such as religious talks (kultum), MABIT, monthly literacy sessions, “Two Days with the Qur’an,” and the School Literacy Movement. Religious Education teachers integrate learning with worship practices and moral guidance; Pancasila Education teachers connect national values with social life; and Indonesian Language teachers develop literacy and character simultaneously through writing assignments and literary appreciation. However, some students noted that the variety of activities for skill development could still be improved to make them more practical and contextually relevant. This explains why 33.3% of respondents (combined moderate and low categories) still felt that strengthening in the area of skills was necessary.

These findings indicate a strong trend in the development of knowledge and attitudes, but a relatively weaker trend in practical skills. This aligns with the findings of (Uyun et al., 2024), which show that the implementation of character-based learning often emphasizes the affective dimension more than applied skills. However, unlike that study, which revealed a fairly significant imbalance, in this study the imbalance remains within moderate limits, thus offering a significant opportunity for optimization through more targeted learning interventions.

Furthermore, these findings also reinforce the perspective (Taufikin, 2025) that learning that integrates knowledge, attitudes, skills, and character constitutes an effort toward the formation of a well rounded individual. However, this study emphasizes that without strengthening the skills aspect (learning to do), such integration may not yet fully achieve a balance among the dimensions of student development. Thus, this study not only confirms existing theories but also identifies specific areas that still require reinforcement in practice.

When compared to the UNESCO framework (2021), the research findings indicate that the pillars of “learning to know,” “learning to be,” and “learning to live together” have been well implemented, whereas the “learning to do” pillar remains

relatively weak. This suggests that learning has not yet fully provided students with opportunities to develop skills through direct experience, practice, and contextual problem-solving.

Based on these findings, recommended improvements include integrating project-based learning or problem based learning into instruction to strengthen students' applied skills through real world experiences, designing practice-based contextual learning activities such as collaborative projects or social initiatives to ensure the "learning to do" pillar is optimally implemented, and developing holistic instructional resources and guidelines that explicitly map the integrated development of knowledge, attitudes, and skills to ensure consistent implementation across all subjects.

2) Learning Integration

Regarding the aspect of learning integration, the questionnaire statement posed was: "The learning I participate in integrates/combines intellectual, emotional, spiritual, social, and physical aspects and is supported by interdisciplinary/co-curricular learning." The results of the quantitative analysis/category distribution show that 43.3% (13 respondents) rated the category as high, 46.7% (14 respondents) rated it as moderate, and 10% (3 respondents) rated it as low. Conceptually, these findings indicate that most students perceive the integration of learning, although there is still room for improvement, particularly in certain aspects.

The results of interviews with teachers and students further support the quantitative findings that students perceive the curriculum to incorporate various dimensions of personal development. In Islamic Religious Education, integration is evident through the reinforcement of verse comprehension, character development, and religious practice; in Pancasila Education through the analysis of social issues and national values; and in Indonesian Language through the integration of text analysis with empathy and students' life experiences. This integration is reinforced through co-curricular activities such as religious talks (kultum), MABIT, "Two Days with the Qur'an," Muhkayyam Tarbawi, the School Literacy Movement, seminars on for adolescents, and daily follow-up (mutabaah yaumiyah) or school-parent communication cards that serve as a bridge between theory and real world practice. However, some students stated that the physical aspect has not yet been fully and consistently integrated into the intracurricular learning. This finding explains why the integration of learning has not yet reached a high level.

These findings indicate that learning integration has been implemented across most dimensions particularly intellectual, spiritual, and social but has not yet been fully realized in the physical dimension. These results align with a study (Sinurat, 2024) showing that a holistic educational approach can simultaneously integrate academic and character development. However, unlike those findings, which indicate relatively even integration, this study identifies that integration in the physical dimension remains suboptimal, particularly in intracurricular learning. This suggests that the implementation of holistic education within the context of integrated Islamic schools still faces challenges in maintaining a balance among the dimensions of student development.

Furthermore, these findings reinforce the perspective (Ariani & Ritonga, 2024) regarding the principle of the unity of knowledge (tauhid al-'ilm) in Islamic education, where the integration of intellectual, spiritual, social, and physical aspects forms the

foundation for the development of the complete human being. However, this study emphasizes that without consistent integration across all dimensions, particularly the physical aspect, this principle has not yet been fully realized in educational practice.

Based on this, recommended improvements include integrating physical activities and hands-on practices more systematically into the curriculum, for example through project-based assignments or contextual practices; developing lesson plans that explicitly include indicators of the integration of the five dimensions of student development so they can be continuously monitored; and strengthening the synergy between co-curricular and intra-curricular activities through integrated cross subject planning, so that learning integration becomes more consistent and meaningful.

b. Incentive Dimension

1) Teacher Strategies

Regarding teacher strategies, the questionnaire statement posed was: "Teachers use a variety of teaching strategies and create a pleasant classroom atmosphere, which makes me more motivated to participate in learning." The results of the quantitative analysis/category distribution show that 53.3% (16 respondents) fell into the high category, 43.4% (13 respondents) into the moderate category, and 3.3% (1 respondent) into the low category. Conceptually, these findings indicate that the majority of students perceive the use of varied learning strategies capable of creating a pleasant classroom atmosphere, although the consistency of this practice is not yet fully uniform.

The results of interviews with teachers and students further support the quantitative findings that teachers use varied strategies such as discussions, case studies, simulations, problem-based learning, project assignments, language games, as well as reflections on values and religious practices. The classroom atmosphere is perceived as comfortable, not rigid, and provides space for students to express their opinions without fear of being wrong. This fosters self-confidence and enhances students' enthusiasm for learning. However, some students noted that the variety of strategies is not always applied in every session, causing learning motivation to fluctuate at times. This finding explains why teachers' strategies have not yet been fully categorized as high.

These findings indicate that the teaching strategies employed by teachers have been effective in creating a pleasant learning environment that motivates students, though they have not been fully consistent across all sessions. These results align with research (Miller & Nigh, 2017) emphasizing that holistic learning must incorporate students' emotional dimensions and personal experiences to make learning meaningful. However, unlike that study, which highlights the consistency of strategy implementation as the key to success, this research indicates that the variation in strategies remains inconsistent, thereby affecting fluctuations in students' learning motivation.

This finding also reinforces the results of a study (Alfi et al., 2024) showing that the use of varied learning strategies such as discussions, group work, and contextual methods can enhance students' learning motivation. However, this study places additional emphasis on the fact that the effectiveness of these strategies lies not only in their diversity but also in the consistency of their application throughout each learning process. In other words, variation without consistency does not yet fully yield optimal effects on learning motivation.

From an Islamic education perspective, these findings align with the concept of *tarbiyah bil hikmah* as articulated by (Elvina et al., 2024), namely a learning process that emphasizes gentleness, exemplary conduct, and a dialogic approach. However, this study indicates that the implementation of these values still needs to be strengthened through more structured pedagogical strategies so as not to rely solely on the individual teaching styles of teachers.

Based on these findings, recommended improvements include developing lesson plans that explicitly integrate a variety of active strategies into each session to ensure more consistent application; establishing school level standards for active learning practices as a shared guideline for teachers; and conducting regular instructional supervision and reflection to ensure that the strategies employed genuinely contribute to enhancing students' learning motivation.

2) Student responses as a direct impact of teachers' incentive strategies

Regarding student responses, the questionnaire statement posed was "I feel that the learning strategies implemented by the teacher encourage me to participate actively and enthusiastically during learning." The results of the quantitative analysis/category distribution show that 36.7% (11 respondents) fell into the high category, 60% (18 respondents) into the moderate category, and 3.3% (1 respondent) into the low category. Conceptually, these findings indicate that students actively and enthusiastically participate during learning, although there is still room for improvement.

The results of interviews with teachers and students reinforce the quantitative findings that students feel motivated to participate actively when teachers use discussion, case studies, simulations, and group work strategies. A comfortable, relaxed classroom atmosphere that values students' opinions encourages them to ask questions and express their ideas. These findings indicate that students' responses to the learning strategies fell into the "fairly good" category, as evidenced by their participation and enthusiasm, although this was not yet entirely consistent. These results align with research (Wahyudi et al., 2024) indicating that students' active participation is influenced by teachers' ability to create a learning environment that is respectful and allows for self expression. However, unlike those findings, which showed relatively high and consistent participation levels, this study identified that students' active participation still tends to fall into the moderate category, suggesting that student engagement is not yet fully optimized.

These results also reinforce Ki Hajar Dewantara's perspective, which emphasizes the importance of harmoniously developing intellect, emotion, and initiative in learning. In the context of this study, the intellectual and emotional aspects have developed through student enthusiasm, but the initiative aspect has not yet consistently emerged. This indicates that the implemented learning strategies have not yet been fully capable of fostering active engagement among all students equally. Thus, this study not only confirms the importance of a positive learning atmosphere but also underscores that the consistent use of active learning strategies is a key factor in enhancing overall student participation.

Based on these findings, recommendations for improvement include ensuring the consistent use of active learning strategies in every session to foster sustained student engagement, implementing more inclusive participatory techniques such as assigning roles in discussions or structured participation so that all students have equal opportunities to participate, and fostering a participatory classroom culture through

enhanced dialogic interactions and feedback that encourages students to express their opinions with confidence.

c. Interaction Dimension

1) Learning Interaction

Regarding the interaction aspect during learning, the questionnaire statement posed was “there is positive and beneficial communication and interaction between me and the teacher, as well as with classmates.” Quantitative analysis/category distribution results indicate that 56.7% (17 respondents) fall into the high category, 40% (12 respondents) into the moderate category, and 3.3% (1 respondent) into the low category. Conceptually, these findings suggest that the majority of students perceive positive two way communication and harmonious social relationships in the learning process, although further strengthening is still needed.

Interview results further elaborate on the quantitative findings, indicating that students perceive fairly open two-way communication with the teacher. The teacher provides opportunities for students to ask questions, express opinions, and respond to the material presented. Among students, there is also good cooperation during group discussions, with a comfortable and conducive classroom atmosphere. However, some students noted that two way communication is not yet fully consistent across every session, and not all students are always actively engaged in classroom interactions. Teachers also confirmed that while the classroom atmosphere is conducive and cooperation is strong, the level of communication engagement is not always consistent among all students. These findings indicate that the quality of interaction is generally good, but the equity of participation still requires strengthening.

These findings indicate that learning interactions have been effective through two-way communication and positive social relationships, though they have not yet been fully equitable across all students. These results align with research (Renfaan et al., 2025) showing that open and mutually respectful interactions can create a conducive and meaningful learning environment. However, unlike those findings, which indicated relatively even interactive participation, this study identified that student engagement in communication still tends to be uneven, thus indicating a participation gap in the classroom.

These findings also reinforce Ki Hajar Dewantara’s view that learning interactions serve as a space for the simultaneous development of intellect, emotion, and action. In the context of this study, the intellectual and emotional aspects have developed through discussion and an atmosphere of mutual respect; however, the aspect of action (participatory behavior) has not yet fully emerged evenly among all students. This indicates that the quality of interaction is already good, but strategies to encourage active participation from all students still need to be strengthened.

Thus, this study not only confirms the importance of dialogic interaction in learning but also emphasizes that equitable participation is a key factor in realizing truly holistic and inclusive learning.

Based on these findings, recommended improvements include implementing more structured interaction strategies, such as rotating small group discussions or open-ended questioning techniques to ensure the involvement of all students; utilizing inclusive participation mechanisms, such as random selection or role assignment within groups, so that every student has an equal opportunity to contribute; and strengthening

a supportive and safe classroom culture so that students who tend to be passive feel more confident in expressing their opinions.

2) Use of Methods

Regarding the use of methods, the questionnaire statement posed was: “the learning methods used by the teacher helped me interact and collaborate with my peers in a focused manner during the learning process.” The results of the quantitative analysis/category distribution show that 46.7% (14 respondents) fell into the high category, 50% (15 respondents) into the moderate category, and 3.3% (1 respondent) into the low category. Conceptually, these findings indicate that the learning methods have supported interaction in a structured manner, but have not yet been fully optimal in actively engaging all students.

Interview results further elaborate on the quantitative findings, indicating that teachers employed methods such as group discussions, problem based learning, presentations, and structured collaborative assignments with clearly defined roles. These methods help students understand the flow of cooperation and build communication within groups. These findings indicate that the teaching method has been effective in supporting structured student interaction and collaboration, but has not yet fully succeeded in fostering active engagement among all students. These results align with research (Fatima et al., 2024) showing that collaborative learning can enhance student interaction and participation through discussions and group work. However, unlike those findings, which indicated relatively even student engagement, this study identified that although a collaborative structure had been well established, individual participation within groups remained inconsistent, thus revealing a gap between the method’s design and its participatory implementation.

This finding also reinforces the perspective of Islamic education as articulated by (Suryadinata & Rahmawati, 2025) that collaborative learning methods reflect the principles of ta’awun (mutual assistance) and musyawarah (consultation). However, this study emphasizes that these values have not been fully internalized if student involvement remains passive or relies on instructions, thus requiring strategies that more strongly encourage individual responsibility within collective work.

Furthermore, these findings align with the philosophy of Ki Hajar Dewantara, who emphasized the harmonious development of intellect, emotion, and initiative. In this study, the aspects of intellect and emotion have developed through discussions and group work; however, the aspect of initiative as a form of proactive action has not emerged uniformly. This indicates that the learning methods employed still need to be strengthened to effectively encourage individual participation within a collaborative context.

Thus, this study not only confirms the effectiveness of collaborative methods but also underscores the importance of integrating method structures with strategies that ensure the active engagement of every individual.

Based on these findings, recommended improvements include implementing mechanisms for individual participation within group work, such as clearly defined role assignments and rotating responsibilities, to ensure every student’s involvement; using an assessment system that accounts for individual contributions in collaborative activities to encourage student engagement; and integrating facilitation techniques that

foster student initiative, such as trigger questions or individual reflections before group discussions.

CONCLUSION

Holistic education based learning is an approach that emphasizes the holistic development of students, encompassing intellectual, emotional, social, spiritual, and physical aspects. Evaluation results indicate that the implementation of holistic education-based learning at SMAIT Al-Fityan School Gowa has generally been successful, particularly in fostering knowledge, attitudes, and character, as well as in creating a positive classroom atmosphere and supportive learning interactions. The integration of Islamic educational values is also evident in teaching practices through the cultivation of religious practices, moral guidance, and the strengthening of social relationships.

However, this implementation has not yet been fully optimized. The development of students' skills (learning to do), the integration of physical aspects, and the consistency in the use of active learning strategies and methods still require strengthening. Additionally, while student participation and interaction have been established, they are not yet evenly distributed among all students, indicating a gap between the learning design and actual engagement in the classroom.

Practically, the findings of this study recommend several measures: strengthening the implementation of project or problem based learning to enhance students' applied skills; integrating physical activities and contextual practices more systematically into the curriculum; and developing holistic learning guidelines that include standards for strategies, methods, and indicators of student engagement to ensure consistent implementation across all subjects. These recommendations are crucial for fostering more balanced, participatory, and sustainable learning.

Theoretically, this study reinforces the concepts of holistic education and Islamic education in the formation of the "insan kamil" (the complete human being), while demonstrating that the success of their implementation is highly dependent on the consistency of pedagogical practices in the classroom. As for future research, it is recommended to expand the scope of the study to various school contexts to obtain broader generalizations of the findings, develop more comprehensive evaluation instruments particularly in measuring skill aspects and physical dimensions and examine in greater depth the effectiveness of specific learning models in supporting the optimal implementation of holistic education.

REFERENCES

- Alfi, M., Muharram, F., & Gusmaneli, G. (2024). Learning Strategies for Enhancing Student Motivation. *Nakula Journal: Center for Education, Language, and Social Sciences*, 2(3), 190–196. <https://doi.org/10.61132/nakula.v2i3.780>
- Ananda, R., & Rafida, T. (2017). *Introduction to Educational Program Evaluation* (1st ed.). Medan: Perdana Publishing.
- Ariani, R., & Ritonga, M. (2024). Analysis of Character Development: Building the Transformation of the Perfect Human According to the Thought of Imam Al-Ghazali. *JIMPI: Innovative Journal of Islamic Education Management*, 3(2), 174–187.
- Azwar, S. (2021). *Development of Psychological Scales*. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar.
- Creswell, J. W. (2014). *Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Methods Approaches* (4th ed.). USA: Thousand Oaks: SAGE Publications.
- Dewantara, K. H. (2013). *Thought, Concepts, Exemplary Conduct, and Independent Attitude, Part I: Education* (5th ed.). Yogyakarta: Universitas Sarjanawiyata Tamansiswa UST-Press.
- Elvina, J., Putri, M. E., & Nabila, S. (2024). Teaching Methods in Surah An-Nahl Verse 125. *Ihsanika: Journal of Islamic Education*, 2(3), 207–217.
- Fatima, F., Rengur, Z. A., & Mansur, N. (2024). Students' Perception of Collaborative Learning's Contribution to Students' Active Participation in ELT Class. *Indonesian Journal of Education and Learning (JPPI)*, 4(2), 496–503. <https://doi.org/10.53299/jppi.v4i2.534>
- Forbes, Scoot H. (2003). *Holistic Education: An Analysis of Its Ideas and Nature*. Foundation for Educational Renewal.
- Illeris, K. (2018). *Contemporary Theories of Learning; Learning Theorists...In Their Own Words* (2nd ed.). New York: Routledge.
- Mahmoudi, Sirous., Ebrahim Jafari, Hasan Ali Nasrabadi, and Mohmmd Javad Liaghatdar. (2012). Holistic Education: An Approach for the 21st Century. *Journal of International Education Studies*, 5(2), 179.
- Makmudi. (2022). The Concept of Character Education for Children from an Islamic Education Perspective According to Ibn Qayyim Al-Jauziyyah. *Jurnal Dirosah Islamiyah*, 4(1), 15–27. Retrieved from <https://journal.laaroiba.com/index.php/jdi/article/view/563>
- Miles, M. B., Huberman, A. M., & Saldana, J. (2014). *Qualitative Data Analysis: A Methods Sourcebook* (3rd ed.). USA: Sage Publications. Translated by Tjetjep Rohidi, UI Press.
- Miller, J. P., & Nigh, K. (2017). *Holistic Education and Embodied Learning*. USA: Information Age Publishing Inc.
- Renfaan, H. Z., Rofiki, A. A., & Ubaidillah, A. (2025). The Role of Classroom Teachers in Implementing Multicultural Values in Aqidah Akhlak Instruction for Fifth-Grade

- Students at MI Integral Hidayatullah. *Ikhlas: Journal of Islamic Education*, 2(4), 87–108.
- Setiawati, R. (2024). *Business Research Methods: Current Research Strategies and Techniques*. Central Kalimantan: PT Asadel Liamsindo Teknologi.
- Sinthiya, I. A. P. A., & Rahman, E. S. (2022). The Implementation of Soft Skills Education in Shaping the Morality of the Younger Generation in the Era of Globalization. *Edification Journal of Islamic Education*, 5(1), 141–151. Retrieved from <https://jurnal.staibsllg.ac.id/index.php/ej/article/view/405/262>
- Sinurat, J. (2024). A Holistic Approach to Character Education: Integrating Academic Learning and Student Character Development. *Journal of Education Quality*, 2(2), 374–380. Retrieved from <https://ejournal.edutechjaya.com/index.php/jkp/article/view/1041>
- Suryadinata, A. M. I., & Rahmawati. (2025). Collaborative Learning Methods in the Context of Islamic Education: Building Cooperation in Learning, 8(6) (2025). *Journal of Collaborative Science*, 8(6), 3468–3474.
- Taufikin. (2025). *Classical and Contemporary Islamic Educational Thought (1st ed.)*. Central Sulawesi: Feniks Muda Sejahtera.
- Law of the Republic of Indonesia No. 20 of 2003, on the National Education System. , (2003).
- UNESCO. (2021). *Reimagining Our Futures Together: A New Social Contract for Education*. Paris: United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization.
- Uyun, H., Robandi, B., & Winursiti, N. M. (2024). Pedagogy and Positive Culture: Efforts to Shape Holistic Student Character. *Pendas: Journal of Basic Education*, 9(4), 34–42. Retrieved from <https://journal.unpas.ac.id/index.php/pendas/article/view/20397/9396>
- Wahyudi, M., Putri, D. M., & Warda, M. A. (2024). Educators and Students in Islamic Education. *At-Tarbiyah: Journal of Islamic Religious Education Research*, 2(1), 565–574.
- Zamroni. (2014). *Sparks of Muhammadiyah Educational Thought*. Yogyakarta: Ombak Publishers.